



ENVIRONMENT POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND SCRUTINY PANEL

RECYCLING & WASTE SERVICES – RESULTS OF CITIZEN LED INSPECTION

REPORT BY HEAD OF OPERATIONAL SERVICES

A. PURPOSE OF REPORT

The purpose of this report is to advise the Environment PDSP of the results of the Citizens Led Inspection (CLI) into Recycling & Waste Services, and to report the improvement plan that has been developed from the inspection and the actions implemented to date.

B. RECOMMENDATION

The Environment PDSP is asked to note:

1. The results of the CLI.
2. The improvement plan that was developed and the progress of implementation post inspection.

C. SUMMARY OF IMPLICATIONS

| | |
|---|--|
| I Council Values | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Focusing on customer needs• Being honest, open and accountable• Making best use of our resources |
| II Policy and Legal (including Strategic Environmental Assessment, Equality Issues, Health or Risk Assessment) | Not applicable. |
| III Implications for Scheme of Delegations to Officers | None. |
| IV Impact on performance and performance Indicators | Successful implementation of the action plan will improve service performance. |
| V Relevance to Single Outcome Agreement | SOA 8 – We make the most efficient and effective use of resources by minimising our impact on the built and natural environment. |
| VI Resources - (Financial, Staffing and Property) | The action plan will be implemented within the existing budget. |

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| VII Consideration at PDSP | None |
| VIII Other consultations | The Executive Management Team has been consulted on the CLI report as well as the Performance and Improvement Service |

D. TERMS OF REPORT

D.1 INTRODUCTION

Recycling, Waste and Fleet Services is responsible for the collection of all household waste and the environmentally responsible management of waste in line with the government's Zero Waste Plan. The service provides a weekly uplift to over 80,000 households and fortnightly uplifts of garden & food waste to the majority of households. The service also carries out around 4,000 bulky uplifts and collect commercial material from council buildings and offices. In total this amounts to more than 8 Million uplifts per year and 65.2 percent of all household waste was recycled in West Lothian last year.

The service has five Community Recycling Centres (CRCs) located throughout West Lothian where residents bring their own household waste for recycling, with over 600,000 visits per year. In addition, we have 150 glass recycling points and provide information and support to customers on how to reduce, reuse and recycle their waste.

The service is also responsible for the provision, management and maintenance of the council's fleet of approximately 1,000 vehicles. This includes commercial vehicles, buses, pool cars and items of plant equipment. With its own team of mechanics, the service operates 24 hours a day and undertakes all safety inspections as well as servicing, repairs and MoTs for the council's fleet and members of the public.

D.2 CITIZENS LED INSPECTION PROCESS

The feedback report provided as Appendix 1 to this paper has been produced following an inspection of Recycling and Waste Services in West Lothian Council against the Citizen Led Inspection framework and using the framework rating system.

The inspection process took place over a number of days between September 2018 and January 2019 and included the following steps:

- Evidence review and site visit planning
- Onsite observation and interviewing
- Consensus on strengths, areas for improvement and scores by the citizen inspection team

The inspection team comprised:

- Mrs Ann Pike
- Mr Peter West

During the inspection process every effort has been made by the team to ensure that conclusions and feedback are based on fact and are the result of consensus. The team interviewed approximately 21 people individually or in groups and visited 3 locations.

D.3 INSPECTION RESULTS

Using the evaluation methods of the Citizen Led Inspection framework the inspection team rated the service as follows:

| <i>Criterion</i> | | <i>Rating (✓)</i> | | | | |
|------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|--------------------|------------------------------|
| | | E (Excellent) | G (Good) | A (Adequate) | W (Weak) | U (Unsatisfactory) |
| 1 | LEADERSHIP | | X | | | |
| 2 | SERVICE PLANNING | | | X | | |
| 3 | PEOPLE RESOURCES | | | | X | |
| 4 | PARTNERS & OTHER RESOURCES | | | X | | |
| 5 | SERVICE PROCESSES | | | X | | |
| 6 | CUSTOMER RESULTS | | | X | | |
| 7 | KEY RESULTS | | X | | | |

D.3.1 Key Strengths

Recycling and Waste Services has demonstrated good practice/performance in the following areas:

- Investment in resources and systems to improve recycling rates.
- Commitment to service delivery by staff at all levels.
- A marked increase in the amount of waste being recycled
- Knowledgeable staff

D.3.2 Key Areas for Improvement

Recycling and Waste Services requires improvement in the following areas:

- Involvement of citizens when designing, implementing and reviewing new approaches.
- Involvement of citizens when making improvement based on citizens' feedback
- Improved approach to complaint handling overall with linkages being made across services, enabling citizen focussed resolutions that answer multiple issues,
- Improved communication across the service, and understanding of the strategic priorities in relation to the delivery of day to day work plans
- Improved approaches in understanding and dealing with staff perceptions

D.4 SERVICE ACTION PLAN

A detailed action plan, (Appendix 2) has been created by the service to address the areas for improvement that have been highlighted. The inspectors will come back for a follow up visit in 6 to 12 months time to reflect the service position following the implementation of the sections restructuring activities through to the frontline staff. This timescale ties in with the completion and implementation of the majority of the key improvement actions identified.

E. CONCLUSION

The Citizen's Led Inspection process within the council has proved itself in terms of developing services based on customer feedback. The latest tranche of inspections have resulted in positive feedback for services and helpful suggestions for areas of improvement.

The CLI for Recycling & Waste Services was undertaken at a time of transition for the service following a period of restructuring and the move into the new Whitehill Service Centre. There are clear areas of focus where improvement and further work has been identified and planned as well as the recognition for the considerable advances made in terms of recycling performance and the commitment to service delivery at all levels.

The action plan will allow the managers to focus on key areas of activity to ensure the service continues to grow and improve as well as demonstrating the progress made to date.

F. BACKGROUND REFERENCES

None

Appendices/Attachments:

Appendix 1: Citizen Led Inspection Feedback Report

Appendix 2: Recycling & Waste Services Action Plan

Contact Person: David Goodenough, Waste Services Manager, 01506 284465, david.goodenough@westlothian.gov.uk

Jim Jack
Head of Operational Services
5 November 2019

CITIZEN LED INSPECTION

FEEDBACK REPORT FOR WEST LOTHIAN COUNCIL

Recycling and Waste Services

January 2019

INSPECTION TEAM:

Ann Pike

Peter West

REPORT SUBMITTED TO:

Jim Jack, Head of Operational Services

David Goodenough, Recycling & Waste Services Manager

1 INTRODUCTION TO FEEDBACK

This feedback report has been produced following an inspection of **Recycling and Waste Services** in West Lothian Council against the Citizen Led Inspection framework and using the framework rating system.

The inspection process took place over a number of days between **September 2018** and **January 2019** and included the following steps:

- Evidence review and site visit planning
- Onsite observation and interviewing
- Consensus on strengths, areas for improvement and scores by the citizen inspection team

The inspection team comprised:

- Mrs Ann Pike
- Mr Peter West

During the inspection process every effort has been made by the team to ensure that conclusions and feedback are based on fact and are the result of consensus. The team have interviewed approximately **21** people individually or in groups and visited **3** locations.

2 KEY STRENGTHS

Recycling and Waste Services has demonstrated good practice/performance in the following areas:

- Investment in resources and systems to improve recycling rates.
- Commitment to service delivery by staff at all levels.
- A marked increase in the amount of waste being recycled
- Knowledgeable staff

3 KEY AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT

Recycling and Waste Services requires improvement in the following areas:

- Involvement of citizens when designing, implementing and reviewing new approaches.
- Involvement of citizens when making improvement based on citizens' feedback
- Improved approach to complaint handling overall with linkages being made across services, enabling citizen focussed resolutions that answer multiple issues,
- Improved communication across the service, and understanding of the strategic priorities in relation to the delivery of day to day work plans
- Improved approaches in understanding and dealing with staff perceptions

4 RATING

The Citizen Inspection team have rated the service as follows:

| CRITERION | RATING (✓) | | | | |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|--------------------|------------------------------|
| | <u>E</u> (Excellent) | <u>G</u> (Good) | <u>A</u> (Adequate) | <u>W</u> (Weak) | <u>U</u> (Unsatisfactory) |
| 1 LEADERSHIP | | X | | | |
| 2 SERVICE PLANNING | | | X | | |
| 3 PEOPLE RESOURCES | | | | X | |
| 4 PARTNERS & OTHER RESOURCES | | | X | | |
| 5 SERVICE PROCESSES | | | X | | |
| 6 CUSTOMER RESULTS | | | X | | |
| 7 KEY RESULTS | | X | | | |

5 OVERVIEW OF THE SERVICE

1 LEADERSHIP

Leaders:

- Identify a clear direction for the service
 - Set long-term outcomes
 - Are open, honest and accountable
 - Put in place scrutiny to challenge performance
-
- Comprehensive information was provided in the Service Information Pack.
 - The overarching aim of 'reducing landfill waste' is the driving force from the R&WS Manager, though not the prime aim at different levels below this. The focus, for example at operative level, is more on their involvement in process.
 - Long term outcomes reflect a number of inputs, for example changes in legislation, changes in Council Policy, and changes in current and projected budget positions.
 - There is some limitation on the Service's ability to plan for the longer term because of Council structures/constraints (e.g. 4 year temp contracts; length of time for restructuring, first mentioned 10 years ago).
 - The R&WS Manager is knowledgeable, very open and helpful with no reason to doubt his honesty. He is accountable and currently being held to account more frequently than the usual cycle.
 - Other managers and team leaders were also open, honest and helpful.
 - All staff indicated an understanding of the service and their role(s) within it but didn't necessarily share the same overall 'vision.'
 - Overall the evaluation of service performance could be improved by key Managers having a greater understanding of the WLAM process and in particular the scoring process. This could improve the ways priority issues are managed without the need for such frequent review meetings. This could also help more effective challenge of the service at all levels and what is driving the key results.
 - The impression was given that there is some lack of awareness of discontent at operative level.
 - Communication to operatives is weak.
 - Process sharing of feedback to and from crews on a daily basis is weak, which contributes to discontent at operative level.
 - We evidenced that R&WS Manager wants to be proactive but previous circumstances (pre Whitehill) and current situations (e.g. delay in restructuring, absence rate, fleet issues) force him to be more reactive and, on occasions, 'firefighting.'
 - Absence rates within the service are improving. This has been helped by the changes in WLC absence policy. There is further scope for managers to improve how they implement this policy within the service. We noted the service intends to do this as part of the current restructuring. This should help people feel there is fairness in how absence is managed.

- The working environment in the new Whitehill depot is not conducive to effective partnership working. A lot of work went into the design of the building to make people feel equal, but the reality is this is not yet working as planned.

Recommendations

- Processes for communicating up and down through the service should be reviewed for effectiveness.
- The process for managing the information from daily sheets should be reviewed for effectiveness and efficiency.
- Restructuring should be completed down to operative level.
- Consideration should be given to making the Whitehill Depot a model for partnership working and a healthier working environment.
- The Service should follow through on its plans for better absence management.
- Leaders in the council should be role models for delivering internal recycling strategies.

Rating: Good

2 SERVICE PLANNING

The service:

- Develop clear strategies
 - Has effective annual planning that outlines the key activities
 - Uses reliable tools and methods to engage and consult with customers
 - Sets and meets targets for performance in all the key areas of activity
-
- The Service produces strategies and plans to comply with Council priorities and National Legislation, with the aim of delivering an efficient, effective service. These plans are reviewed continuously.
 - There is a lengthy and time consuming process involved in introducing changes to plans.
 - There have been instances of confusion over short/medium term deployment of new approaches being introduced ahead of when the key resources would be in place to make these effective, e.g. introducing new routing before the Whitehill depot was in place. This had led to a spike in complaints on at least a couple of occasions.
 - Changes can sometimes be introduced without adequate information, to help explain the rationale for the change, being given to customers and to staff.
 - Plans can be overturned very rapidly by senior council officials following elected member intervention. This can have a complicated knock on effect on planning, both short and long term, and on staff morale, at all levels.
 - Individual waste management policies were discussed and it was clear there is a passion amongst the team for delivering these policies. However where it was less clear and joined up was where waste collection management aligns

to wider aspects of waste management in relation to (e.g.) improved recycling behaviours, fly-tipping, grounds maintenance.

- Consultation methods target only a small proportion of customers, or are 'reactive' to customer complaints.
- There was clear evidence of detailed planning for when disruptions to waste collection could happen (e.g. severe winter weather) with improvements being planned based on previous experiences. However this is reliant on staff good will to work on (e.g.) bank holidays at Easter, or weekends at Christmas, and when staff morale is low, plans cannot depend on good will, as evidenced over Christmas 2018/New Year 2019
- It was less clear how planning takes place for staff development needs, complaints root cause analysis, and joining up citizen consultations to inform improvements. Complaints and input from councillors appears to be the main pro-active ways citizens' views are used to inform processes and policy improvements.
- Complaints are seen as important but there was less evidence of effective root cause analysis of complaints and of complaint information reaching front line staff to help them improve their interaction with customers
- Customer handling training is being considered but we didn't see evidence that this will definitely happen as a mandatory part of staff development.
- The service should use every opportunity possible (e.g. opening of the new Whitehill Depot) to inform and involve citizens and help educate them on how to help the service meet its outcomes.
- There is a set of targets the service effectiveness is measured against. Some have been exceeded spectacularly, e.g. waste diverted from landfill. Others have targets which are not properly challenging enough.
- There was clear formal performance reporting upwards but it was less clear how performance is effectively reported downwards and the daily/end of shift meetings could be made more effective in this regard.
- Perceptions vary at different levels as to what success for the service looks like. Due to the difference of vision for the service at different levels, performance reporting will appear to some people out of line with their personal performance drivers.
- There was evidence that some targets are not being met because of issues out with the service's control.

Recommendations

- The service should have greater involvement of both customers and employees in development of business plans and processes to meet strategic aims.
- Consideration should be given across services, e.g. Waste and NETS, to the sharing of daily information regarding waste, litter, fly-tipping, etc.
- The Council should consider how services, including waste management, collaborate to consider root cause analysis of shared issues at household level, thus optimising resources.

- The service impacts on every West Lothian household and consideration should be given to how this could be used as a resource to educate and inform citizens on a wide range of WLC policies and practices, including, but not restricted to waste management.
- Care should be taken to ensure that any changes to policy or process are fully explained to staff and tested with customers before their introduction, including the use of pilots and phased introductions, thus avoiding disproportionate negative public feedback
- Closer attention should be given to root cause analysis of complaints to inform appropriate improvement activities targeting customer satisfaction both a service level and, potentially, at Council level.

Rating: Adequate

3 PEOPLE RESOURCES

The service:

- Identifies the right people resources it needs to achieve outcomes
 - Sets out desired qualities and acceptable behaviours for staff
 - Reviews and improves individual people's performance
 - Communicates effectively with people
 - Involves people in reviewing and improving the service
-
- The service is currently undergoing a restructure which has been discussed and planned for the last 10 years.
 - The service will be able to recognise if it has the right people resources only after the restructuring has been completed.
 - The re-structuring does not appear to be going down to operative levels therefore this will have an impact on ensuring the right skills and behaviours are being developed to work effectively within the new structure.
 - The rationale for running with lengthy and multiple temporary contracts is not clear in relation to driving staff motivation and helping deliver the councils aims of going above and beyond for its customers. The rationale and how the policy is to be used does not match to working conditions and therefore is not effective in doing what it was meant to do. (See below)
 - The recruitment of staff for some time has mainly been internal and does not enable or represent a diverse workforce or show the councils ambition to have a diverse workforce.
 - Attempts have been made to develop staff in ways that helps with absence management and disruptions to services but this has not been systematic due to the delayed plans for re-structuring.
 - The service has been somewhat restricted in arriving at the right mix of staff because of WLC recruitment policies (eg some staff has been on temporary contracts for 4 years).
 - The service sets out qualities and behaviours but does not always fully communicate these to all levels of staff in an effective manner.
 - Not all staff have individual reviews.

- Staff at all levels are not fully engaged in reviewing and improving the service on a continuous basis.
- The processes in place that staff are working with are not always focussed on customer improvement and on occasions are seen as tick box exercises.
- The service continues to have a higher absence rate than most other areas of the council. This is improving – there is a new Council absence procedure which is having some impact but needs to be monitored carefully following the re-structure to ensure the plans deliver the improvements the new structure is aiming to do.
- People know what is working and what isn't and need encouraged to play an effective part in changing things for the better. We evidenced a willingness to do this by staff.

Recommendations

- Staff should be made fully aware of how the restructuring will benefit them, and how they can get the most out of the new structure.
- The service needs to reconsider its use of so many extended temporary contracts.
- The service needs to reconsider the reliance on good will of staff to maintain delivery of services at times of disruption.
- Following the restructure, the service should ensure the Council's appraisal strategy is followed.
- The service should involve staff at all levels more in creating improved practices and an improved working environment.
- There should be much more feedback to operatives on how any concerns they have raised or informed (via daily sheets for example) have been processed.
- Existing communication tools should be used more effectively to keep operatives informed.
- How service users who repeatedly do not follow recycling guidelines or perhaps do not fully understand them, reported by operatives, are dealt with should be reviewed to see if an improved approach could be more effective, with positive outcomes more obvious to staff.

Rating: Weak

4 PARTNERS & OTHER RESOURCES

The service:

- Manages partnerships to add value for the customer
- Manages finances to deliver quality services sustainably
- Uses information and knowledge to support and enhance service delivery
- Uses assets (land, buildings, vehicles and equipment) to optimum effect

- The service has internal and external partners.
- From what we experienced the service works well with external partners to give 'best' value.
- We evidenced good practice of joined up working with internal partners e.g. Corporate Comms. However from what we experienced there are still opportunities to work with internal partners in a more joined up way to add value for customers.
- As this service is the only service to impact every citizen in West Lothian, there must be other opportunities to link up challenges from other services, and, by working together, find customer based solutions, not process based solutions. This could potentially save time and money for the council overall.
- The external environment has a disproportionate impact on the cost of this service and therefore having strong external partnerships with others could help share the burden of this.
- The service's plan is properly costed and meets all budget requirements. External factors, e.g. increased waste disposal costs can impact on sustainability.
- Strategic planning and IT systems appear to be well utilised in supporting delivery. However there is an opportunity to review the systems brought in as part of Whitehill as a 'Super Depot' to ensure the benefits are being realised and utilised fully.
- Relocation to Whitehill has improved some aspects of delivery over the Deans depot. However some facilities are still not fully commissioned, e.g. waste transfer station.
- Possible safety issues will emerge as this process continues, e.g. waste transfer station floor.
- Some staff do not like the management of the new depot or its facilities and 'ambience.'
- Recycling & Waste Management staff suggested that some HWRC sites are not fit for purpose and may be unsafe. Such facilities need to be reviewed to ensure they are effective and fit for purpose to maintain a safe and usable environment for staff and the public, e.g. Linlithgow HWRC site
- Difficulties with provision by internal partners can impact on efficiency, e.g. fleet issues mean that vehicles are not always suitable or available for use.
- There is a great source of information being brought back from customers indirectly and directly as a result of some key resources that have been put in place i.e. daily sheets and phones. These sources of information could be used better for optimum effect.

- The move to have fleet and waste under 1 manager should bring about improved management of resources and delivery of services.
- The buildings and equipment in place as a result of operating from Whitehill could benefit for a review involving staff to improve efficiency and effectiveness of this 'super depot.'

Recommendations

- There should be a comprehensive review of the planned benefits of the move to Whitehill.
- Given the decision to retain the 5 existing HWRC sites, health and safety issues need to be reconsidered.

Rating: Adequate

5 SERVICE PROCESSES

The service:

- Designs processes to meet the needs of customers
 - Ensures processes are efficient and effective
 - Delivers services to customers in the way they want
 - Reviews the efficiency and effectiveness of processes
 - Uses customer feedback as part of the review process
-
- Processes are designed to improve re-cycling and meet budget reductions not but it was not always obvious how this was done with the customer in mind.
 - What the customer needs and what the customer wants are not always the same.
 - Complaints arise because the customer does not always get what the customer wants or thinks they should get.
 - There is a definite lack of customer education and awareness of their role and responsibility in waste management.
 - Perceptions of what the customer is paying for by way of council tax lags the reality of what was agreed in the consultation 'Transforming Your Council'.
 - If customers are not constantly reminded/educated about the changes that are coming up the track for waste, this will have an on-going impact on complaints and potentially overturning key decisions needed to save the necessary budget targets.
 - There are recent changes taking place to help educate the customers around 'why' things are done the way they are, and educating call handlers appears to be helping the customer experience on the phone. It is also leading to informed notifications being posted on WLC website and media communications.
 - Some evidence exists that budget restrictions limit the extent to which processes can meet the needs of all customers (e.g. vehicle size too large for some areas, but smaller vehicles would incur higher costs). This gave the impression that costs/savings often impact on customer satisfaction.

- The Service – as evidenced by employees at all levels - certainly aims to be efficient and effective.
- The main customer ‘feedback’ is complaints. The service considers these in developing or changing processes.
- Levels of customer satisfaction are measured through traditional council wide mechanisms but for this service it is based on very small samples.

Recommendations

- The service and the wider Council needs to better manage customer expectations, particularly at a time of budget constraints.
- The service should continue to constantly review efficiency and effectiveness of processes.
- The service should consider how it can increase its customer sample size to help inform appropriate change.

Rating: Adequate

6 CUSTOMER RESULTS

The service:

- Are measuring the right thing(s) in relation to customer results and what is important to the customer
- Can show positive and sustained good performance over a period of 3 or more years
- Have set and met challenging targets
- Compare their own performance against performance leaders in other councils or organisations
- Can explain any dips in their performance or positive changes

- There remains a disconnect between what is important to many customers and what should be important to them in relation to the strategic aims of the service. This has an impact on customer results.
- Most targets and results shown were based on small samples and their statistical significance must be viewed with caution.
- Any changes made to the service as a result of current customer results may not be appropriate.
- The service deals with customer enquiries and complaints efficiently.

Recommendations

- The service should consider ways of gathering real time customer perceptions.
- The service should consider what internal indicators should be set for managing the resolution of customer enquiries and tasks raised via daily sheets.

Rating: Adequate

7 KEY PERFORMANCE RESULTS

The service:

- Are measuring the right thing(s) in relation to the key activities and the long-term outcomes
- Can show positive and sustained good performance over a period of 3 or more years
- Have set and met challenging targets
- Compare their own performance against performance leaders in other councils or organisations
- Can explain any dips in their performance or positive changes

- Measurements of e.g. waste being recycled, waste diverted from landfill, cost per household of waste disposal, waste collection effectiveness, etc. all help inform process management.
- Recycling rates show an improving trend over the last 3 years, with the rate of 61.3% in 2017/18 exceeding the target for the first time. All year's show a favourable performance against the benchmark.
- Most key targets are being met, though not all of these are benchmarked.
- There are spikes in the target for missed bins, particularly in Q4 2017/18 and Q1 2018/19. Some reasons given for this (weather and fleet issues) were out with the service's control. Service plans for managing this were in part overruled.
- Targets should be adjusted to take account of changing circumstances, e.g. Cost of refuse collection service per household target should have been reduced to take account of the introduction of the new transfer station.

Recommendations

- The service should consider the positive impact on key results by signing up to the Scottish Waste Charter.

Rating: Good

6 REVIEW DATE






The Citizen Inspection team will return to the service in early 2020 to review the progress in the areas identified for improvement following the completion of the restructuring activities throughout the service.





CITIZEN LED INSPECTION - SERVICE IMPROVEMENT PLAN




Recycling & Waste Services






October 2019





| STATUS KEY:  Completed  On Target  Not Started  Behind Schedule, Overdue | | | | | | |
|--|--|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
| 1 | Leadership | | | | | |
| 1.1 | Processes for communicating up and down through the service should be reviewed for effectiveness | <p>The process for communicating up and down through the service will be reviewed with a representative groups of staff and stakeholders to confirm the actions raised will be effective including:</p> <p>The delivery method and medium for Corporate briefings;</p> <p>Internal staff/representative consultation groups and opportunities such as the</p> | Mar-19 | May-19 | DMcP, GW |  |





| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|--------------------------|--|------------|-----------------|-----------|--------|
| | | <p>Service Works Committee, Procurement and Project involvement;</p> <p>The use of daily updates sent to the CSC, Head of Service and Depute Chief Executive to provide day to day information on service issues and progress from the previous day's issues;</p> <p>The use of staff meetings as per the People Strategy from management level to frontline staff;</p> <p>The use and effectiveness of the debrief sessions;</p> <p>Access to IT for frontline staff to systems which are available to all other staff, such as TMS, HR21, Intranet, Corporate e-updates and newsletters;</p> <p>The use frontline IT suite on the ground floor at Whitehill Service Centre</p> <p>The potential to create a regular service update page for electronic noticeboards and issuing to outlying staff including up to date performance figures for relevant KPI's and recycling rates to provide the context to work activities along with complaints and praise received from the public.</p> <p>The utilisation of training sessions for crews and for Recycling Centre staff as</p> | | | | |



| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|---|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | <p>well as Tool Box Talks for frontline staff prior to departure on beats.</p> <p>To reinforce the initial training refreshers will be provided to explain what happens to waste and importance of collection staff for policing contamination and diverting waste from landfill, basic cost implications, so can equate to jobs etc</p> <p>Provide updates, delivered in the appropriate style and context to explain other changes, such as legislation and contracts, when relevant.</p> | | | | |
| 1.2 | The process for managing the information from daily sheets should be reviewed for effectiveness and efficiency. | The initial review of this area of the service is complete. Further feedback on the effectiveness of this process change as it is being implemented will be gained through the review process noted in Item 1.1. | Jan-19 | Feb-19 | DMcP, GW |  |
| | | The service are in the process of allocating beats to individual crews to create ownership, a more robust debriefing process and sense of achievement for each crew with goals and targets set for performance. For example a focus on assisted take out collections and areas where access issues occur, which then enables information to be fed back to both the staff and the CSC from actions taken. | Jan-19 | Mar-19 | DMcP |  |
| | | New Squad leaders and Officers are in | Jan-19 | Jan-19 | DMcP, GW | |



| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|--|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|--|
| | | place which has given a more robust daily planning and debrief process, individual Officers and Squad leaders have been allocated specific areas of responsibility to ensure that there is a direct and clear line of communication, responsibility and outcomes expected for activities undertaken in a given day. A communications plan is being devised for the implementation of the new aspects of the agreed Customer Service Standards, which will cover Senior Manager, Elected Member, CSC, Frontline and other stakeholder engagement. | Feb-19 | Apr-19 | AT |   |
| 1.3 | Restructuring should be completed down to operative level. | The service have progressed the restructure as far as it is possible at this stage, with the Contracts and Resources Officers being the final posts to recruit. The operative level part of the structure is dominated by fixed term and temporary contracts which are the concern noted by staff on the frontline within the CLI report. From a service perspective having permanent full time staff provides a greater buy-in from staff and allows for planned long term development. However, it is acknowledged that this final part of the restructuring of the service cannot be completed until the full implementation of the approved TYC | Feb-19 | Apr-20 | DG |  |




| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|--|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | savings and at that stage this action can be completed through the Managing Workforce Change procedure. | | | | |
| 1.4 | Consideration should be given to making the Whitehill Depot a model for partnership working and a healthier working environment. | Operational Services are engaged at a service and building level through joint communications and Health & Safety committees as well as through the Building User Group. Cross service working is also demonstrated through engagement in initiatives such as Health Working Lives and other corporate initiatives within Whitehill Service Centre. | Ongoing | Ongoing | JJ |  |
| | | Consideration should be given to providing more social opportunities and links to the activities that are currently offered at the Civic Centre which are relevant to the workforce at Whitehill. | Feb-19 | Ongoing | JF |  |
| 1.5 | The Service should follow through on its plans for better absence management. | All Management, Officers, Squad leaders have received corporate training in the delivery of the new Supporting Attendance at Work Policy and the transition arrangements. | Jan-19 | Feb-19 | DMcP, GW |  |
| | | The service dashboards are to be updated to separate the attendance into the individual areas of responsibility. | Feb-19 | Mar-19 | HP |  |
| | | Internally to the service all managers, officers and Squad Leaders have received training in the internal processes | Feb-19 | Mar-19 | DG |  |



| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|---|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | <p>for recording absence and managing the process required to complete all absences and reviews as per the advised policy time frames.</p> <p>Allocate individual employees to an officer who will be responsible for their pastoral care.</p> <p>Provide officers and staff with the monthly Sickness Stats and HR information.</p> <p>Promotion of the Employee Assistance Program to enable self-help and self-referral to be seen as another alternative to improving attendance for aspects such as anti-poverty, mental health, workplace chaplaincy, counselling.</p> | Feb-19 | Feb-19 | DMcP, GW |  |
| | | | Jan-19 | Ongoing | HP |  |
| | | | Jan-19 | Jan-19 | Officers |  |
| 1.6 | Leaders in the council should be role models for delivering internal recycling strategies | This doesn't stop with leaders within the council but covers all council staff. The service have, through the restructure, employed an additional Strategy Support Officer to champion internal recycling and waste minimisation activities across the council. The service have actively been rolling out systems over the last two years internally and with the centralisation of waste budgets this will continue to drive down costs and improve recycling performance. Externally this requires the support and buy in to ensure that the new Customer Service Standards are implemented and supported to deliver the | Dec-18 | Ongoing | DG, AT |  |





| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|----------|--|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | <p>desired environmental improvement.</p> <p>Further buy-in can be supported by promoting a back to the shop floor commitment. This will see members, senior managers and support staff being given the opportunity to get out with crews to see what face, how recycling centre staff manage the volumes of traffic and verbal abuse on the sites and through this gain a full understanding of the frontline experience.</p> | Jan-19 | Sept-19 | DMcP, GW |  |
| 2 | Service Planning | | | | | |
| 2.1 | The service should have greater involvement of both customers and employees in development of business plans and processes to meet strategic aims. | <p>The service will seek the capacity and time to be provided to undertake suitable and robust consultation on the development of business plans and strategic changes</p> <p>Internally the service have a fully developed communications plan which include consultation, focus groups, ISM events, questionnaires and engagement activities directly related to the service activities.</p> <p>The use of the Citizens Panel will be reviewed as it does not currently provide a suitable level of response, in terms of rate, or specificity in terms of being directly attributable to the activities of the service. If a wider standardised approach</p> | Feb-19 | Ongoing | DG |  |
| | | | Feb-19 | Annual | AT |  |
| | | | Apr-19 | Nov-19 | AT |  |





| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|---|--|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | cannot be found then the methods described within the communications plan will be used to support the collection of participation information and engagement. | | | | |
| 2.2 | Consideration should be given across services, eg Waste and NETS, to the sharing of daily information regarding waste, litter, fly-tipping, etc.. | Access to CONFIRM is provided across the services to check the completion status of Bulky collections and the online update page (public) enables other services to see where issues could occur due to delays or access problems. Cross service meetings occur where there are areas of mutual interest such as flytipping, litter reporting issues and complaints. The Whitehill Service Centre also provides collaborative opportunities to work and communicate with the other services as all of the officers are within the same building and area. This is particularly relevant at Squad Leader level where the frontline officer is shared across the service areas and with the CSC Resolver Team. | Jan-19 | Jan-19 | DG |  |
| 2.3 | The Council should consider how services, including waste management, collaborate to consider root cause analysis of shared issues at household level, thus optimising resources. | Following the roll out of the 140I project the post-delivery appraisal highlighted the need to explore other communication routes and stakeholders out with those originally thought of. Through presentations at the Leadership & | Nov-18 | Ongoing | DG |  |




| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|---|--|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | <p>Development Training and meetings separately with other services new communication routes and stakeholders have been identified and this will be incorporated in to future planning and service changes to ensure as many shared issues are covered. For example: undertaking training for other relevant services on changes and new policy, e.g. contamination – problems caused, costs, why important to stop and to help answer questions at source and disseminate information, such as Housing, CSC/ CIS/ Env Health, NETS etc.</p> <p>Work is required to ensure that other services and members are aware of the roles and remit of the service, as well as how this compares to that offered by other councils and private providers. Examples of this are the interpretation that all litter and flytipping is for this service to manage and collect, where as it is either a landlord issue or potentially a NETS issue, which is where the resource is provided to manage this. This will form an integral part of the engagement plan for the new Customer Service Standards.</p> | Mar-19 | May-19 | AT |  |
| 2.4 | The service impacts on every West Lothian household and consideration | Training staff in customer care and | Apr-19 | Jan-20 | DG |  |



| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|---|--|------------|--------------------------|------------|---|
| | should be given to how this could be used as a resource to educate and inform citizens on a wide range of WLC policies and practices, including, but not restricted to waste management. | <p>situation management can help them to be ambassadors e.g. explain why we do what we do, why changes occur and know who to feed questions to when they can't answer. This applies not only to collection staff but to all frontline staff across the council.</p> <p>The service should also consider the ability to advertise other services messages through the use of panels on vehicles or hoardings on sites. Potentially the service could also provide updates and messages via packs that could be affixed to containers to reduce postage costs.</p> | Mar-19 | Jun-19 | Corp Comms |  |
| 2.5 | Care should be taken to ensure that any changes to policy or process are fully explained to staff and tested with customers before their introduction, thus avoiding disproportionate negative public feedback. | <p>Actions to engage and communicate with staff are covered in previous actions.</p> <p>Where possible testing with customers should be undertaken in the form of pilots and trials to enable a direct West Lothian analogue to be drawn prior to implementing wide ranging changes.</p> | Jul-19 | Ongoing strategic change | DG |  |
| 2.6 | Closer attention should be given to root cause analysis of complaints to inform appropriate improvement activities targeting customer satisfaction both a service level and, potentially, at Council level. | The service commit to undertake root cause analysis of complaints to inform appropriate improvement activities at the service level as well as through the Corporate Complaints Board. The introduction of the new frontline structure is designed to ensure that Officers have a wider overview of patterns and repeat | Feb-19 | Ongoing | DG |  |





| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|----------|--|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | <p>issues which when combined with feedback from CIS/ CSC about additional CONFIRM categories which will enable more detailed breakdown of causes of enquiries/ complaints/ missed bins, so does not have to be done manually i.e. by reading the script. E.g. missed bins has large proportion of 'please select'. This would result in a longer pick list, but will help CIS/ CSC in long term if more understanding of the reasons why customers are contacting us is known.</p> <p>When patterns are noted within issues and complaints a wider understanding of the issues which can or cannot be influenced by the service needs to be understood. For example if the number of available vehicles is reduced due to weather related breakdowns then an understanding of an increase in complaints caused by missed collections should be noted and communicated to relevant groups and stakeholders.</p> | Feb-19 | Ongoing | DMcP, GW |  |
| 3 | People Resources | | | | | |
| 3.1 | Staff should be made fully aware of how the restructuring will benefit them, and how they can get the most out of the new structure. | <p>Throughout the restructure process there were updates provided to explain the rationale and benefits of the structure. This included briefings to all staff.</p> <p>Following the implementation of the structure a staff focus group will be</p> | Nov-18 | Jan-19 | DG |  |





| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|--|--|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | brought together to review the introduction of the process and whether the benefits sought have been realised, as described under Item 1.1. | Apr-19 | Jun-19 | DMcP, GW |  |
| 3.2 | The service needs to reconsider its use of so many extended temporary contracts. | As per Item 1.3: The operative level part of the structure is dominated by fixed term and temporary contracts which are the concern noted by staff on the frontline within the CLI report. It is acknowledged that this final part of the restructuring of the service cannot be completed until the full implementation of the approved TYC savings and at that stage this action can be completed through the Managing Workforce Change procedure. The recruitment into the permanent roles has commenced in October 2019. | Feb-19 | Apr-20 | DG |  |
| 3.3 | The service needs to reconsider the reliance on goodwill of staff to maintain delivery of services at times of disruption. | The service have engaged with HR to determine which routes are available to seek a guaranteed workforce on known days where disruption will occur (Public Holidays) | Jan-19 | Apr-19 | HR |  |
| | | The ability to train up and call upon other frontline staff to cover collection services is being considered within Operational Services. However, any use of this for periods of unforeseen sickness or service disruption would cause knock on effects within the services providing the staff for collection staff. | Mar-19 | May-19 | JJ |  |





| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|---|--|------------|-----------------|--------------------------|---|
| 3.4 | Following the restructure, the service should ensure the Council's appraisal strategy is followed. | With the introduction of the Squad Leader staff and dedicated pools of employees the ability to tie in developmental (through the SWITCH competency framework) and performance appraisal forms a part of the engagement process with individuals and teams. This is in addition to the annual ADR's which are conducted annually. This will be monitored through the individual training records for all staff members where the ADR and SWITCH/Performance appraisals will be logged. | Mar-19 | Ongoing | DMcP, GW |  |
| 3.5 | The service should involve staff at all levels more in creating improved practices and an improved working environment. | As detailed under Items 1.1 & 2.1 the service communications plan includes the use of employee focus groups and ISM sessions to ensure that staff are engaged and brought in to improvement activities. | Apr-19 | Ongoing | AT |  |
| | | Where specific involvement is required the service utilise frontline crews to test and develop models for service delivery, such as rerouting activities where frontline input is essential. | Historical | Ongoing | DG |  |
| 3.6 | There should be much more feedback to operatives on how any concerns they have raised or informed (via daily sheets for example) have been processed. | As detailed under Items 1.1 & 2.1 the improvement in the line management structure, responsibilities and communication through the debrief process will greatly assist in the provision of feedback and opportunities to raise issues for action allowing for a robust 'you | Feb-19 | Ongoing | Officers & Squad Leaders |  |


| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|--|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| | | <p>said, we did' approach to be implemented.</p> <p>Quarterly service updates are planned for individual service areas (Collection, Disposal, Recycling Centres etc) on key performance areas and service actions which help inform staff and provide feedback on issues raised and performance.</p> | Apr-19 | Ongoing | KK |  |
| 3.7 | Existing communication tools should be used more effectively to keep operatives informed. | <p>As a part of the actions under Item 1.1 the service will be reviewing the communication tools currently used and their effectiveness.</p> <p>This includes the utilisation of:</p> <p>Handheld devices (mobile phones) for information.</p> <p>TV screens to be utilised to educate and inform staff.</p> <p>The use of the debrief process and dedicated time for Tool Box Talks and training sessions.</p> | Mar-19 | May-19 | DMcP, GW |  |
| 3.8 | How service users who repeatedly do not follow recycling guidelines or perhaps do not fully understand them, reported by operatives, are dealt with should be reviewed to see if an improved approach could be more effective, with positive outcomes more | For contamination - the application of the new Customer Service Standards and the more robust and interactive debrief process will enable more two way feedback from the Engagement Officers and Squad Leaders back to the crews on serial offenders. | Apr-19 | Apr-20 | AT |  |

| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|----------|--|---|------------|-----------------|------------|---|
| | obvious to staff. | Further development of the use of CONFIRM Connect to report and log issues and actions on a property by property basis will enable operatives and crews to see the responses and resolutions put in to place. | May-19 | Apr-20 | DMcP, SH-A |  |
| 4 | Partners & Other Resources | | | | | |
| 4.1 | There should be a comprehensive review of the planned benefits of the move to Whitehill. | Operational Services will conduct a comprehensive review into the planned benefits of the move to the Whitehill Service Centre from an employee, stakeholder and business perspective. This will take place through a cross service working group chaired by the Head of Service. | May-19 | Apr-20 | JJ |  |

| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|---|--|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| 4.2 | Given the decision to retain the 5 existing HWRC sites, health and safety issues need to be reconsidered. | The Recycling Centres are subject to Health & Safety checks from Operative level through to Union, Health & Safety Officer, Property related and management inspections. Where safety critical infrastructure issues arise they are dealt with through property requests to ensure the sites are maintained in a safe manner for their intended purpose. Site staff are all fully trained and have routes through line manager, Trade Union representation and through the section and service Works Committee meetings to raise any issues. | continual | ongoing | DG |  |
| | | Zero Tolerance policy on violence and aggression in place with a further staff training on how to handle abusive customers is to be included. | Apr-19 | Jun-19 | GW |  |
| | | Planned Maintenance programme to be supplied to Property Services and others to ensure that both proactive and reactive repairs are carried out as a matter of urgency. | Apr-19 | Jun-19 | GW |  |
| | | Working collaboratively with the TU Health & Safety representative and site staff to monitor and action any reactive changes required. | Historical | Ongoing | DG, GW |  |

| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|------|---|--|---|--|--|--|
| 5 | Service Processes | | | | | |
| 5.1 | The service and the wider Council needs to better manage customer expectations, particularly at a time of budget constraints. | <p>The new Customer Service Standards clearly state what the level of service provided will be for customers.</p> <p>Standardised responses and templates should be created for senior management, elected members and other staff members responding to enquiries relating to policy changes.</p> <p>The retention of the resolver team within the Squad Leaders office enables collaborative working and cross service support to ensure that customer expectations are managed as swiftly as possible with input directly from the frontline teams. This includes the key worker link with a service champion for Waste Services within the CSC team.</p> | <p>Apr-19</p> <p>Mar-19</p> <p>Nov-18</p> | <p>Ongoing</p> <p>As required</p> <p>Ongoing</p> | <p>DG, GH</p> <p>DG, GH</p> <p>DG, CSC</p> | <p></p> <p></p> <p></p> |
| 5.2 | The service should continue to constantly review efficiency and effectiveness of processes | The service are engaging with Zero Waste Scotland to explore opportunities to improve the capture and use of information relating to the presentation of containers and their successful collection through the use of RFID technology and other emerging tech. | Jan-19 | Apr-20 | DG |  |

| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|----------|--|--|------------|-----------------|------------|---|
| | | <p>The service will be undergoing a full service review and options appraisal as a part of the transition to a Charter compliant service. This will include benchmarking efficiency to that of the datasets obtained by Zero Waste Scotland.</p> <p>Following restructuring activities the PI management and recording is to be reviewed to ensure that it fits with the new working approach and provide relevant information to enable Managers and Officers to manage their sections.</p> | Jan-19 | Apr-20 | DG |  |
| | | | Mar-19 | Apr-19 | DG |  |
| 6 | Customer Results | | | | | |
| 6.1 | The service should consider ways of gathering real time customer perceptions. | As per Item 2.1 Additionally corporate reviews of the usage of Facebook and Social Media analytics is to be considered to help provide real time customer perceptions. | Jan-19 | Jul-19 | Corp Comms |  |
| 6.2 | The service should consider what internal indicators should be set for managing the resolution of customer enquiries and tasks raised via daily sheets | Complaint tracking via CONFIRM is to be explored to enable the capture and reporting of customer enquiries and their resolution or confirmation via the daily debrief process and daily tasking process. | Mar-19 | Jul-19 | DMcP |  |

| ITEM | INSPECTOR RECOMMENDATION | IMPROVEMENT ACTION BY SERVICE | START DATE | COMPLETION DATE | ACTION BY | STATUS |
|----------|---|---|------------|-----------------|-----------|---|
| 7 | Key Performance Results | | | | | |
| 7.1 | The service should consider the positive impact on key results by signing up to the Scottish Waste Charter. | Signing up to Charter advises to “provide the evidence, research, benchmarking and examples required to deliver the commitments in this Charter and the associated Code of Practice” working alongside the service to provide the evidence required to consider key results, The charter guidelines also aim to “provide support, advice and guidance to local government that allows successful implementation of changes to services”. The council agreed to the signing of the Charter on 4 th December 2018. | Dec-18 | Dec-18 | DG |  |

JJ – Jim Jack (Head of Service)

DG – David Goodenough (Service Manager – Recycling & Waste)

DMcP – (Operations Manager)

GW – Gillian Wilson (Contracts & Resources Manager)

AT – Alison Towers (Engagement 7 Awareness Team Leader)

KK – Karen King (Performance & Data Team Leader)

JF – Jamie Fisher (Service Manager – FM)

GH – Garry Heron (Corporate Communications Manager)

MK – Michael Kelly (Collection Services Officer)