

MINUTE of MEETING of the WEST LOTHIAN COUNCIL held within Council Chambers, Civic Centre, Livingston, on 24 May 2016.

Present – Provost Tom Kerr (Chair), Depute Provost Dave King, Council Leader John McGinty, Councillors Frank Anderson, Stuart Borrowman, Tony Boyle, Diane Calder, Janet Campbell, Harry Cartmill, Tom Conn, Alexander Davidson, Robert De Bold, Jim Dickson, Mary Dickson, Jim Dixon, David Dodds, Lawrence Fitzpatrick, Carl John, Sarah King, Danny Logue, Greg McCarra, Anne McMillan, Andrew Miller, Angela Moohan, Cathy Muldoon, George Paul, Barry Robertson, David Tait, Frank Toner, Jim Walker.

Apologies – Councillors William Boyle, Peter Johnston, John Muir

1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Motion – St John’s Hospital (Agenda Item 6)

Councillor Toner declared a significant non-financial interest as he was employed by Neil Findlay, MSP. He indicated that he would leave the Chambers and take no part in consideration of this item of business.

Motions (Agenda items 7 and 9)

Councillor Toner declared a non-financial interest as a Non-Executive Director of NHS Lothian. He made a correction to his declaration later in the meeting to reflect that he had resigned from the position.

Councillor Logue declared a non-financial interest as an employee of NHS Lothian.

2. MINUTES

- (a) The Council approved the minute of meeting of West Lothian Council held on 12 April 2016.
- (b) The Council note the correspondence arising from previous decisions.
- (d) The Council noted the minute of meeting of the Employee Appeals Committee held on 18 March 2016.
- (d) The Council noted the minute of meeting of the Employee Appeals Committee held on 18 March 2016.
- (e) The Council noted the minute of meeting of the Education (Quality Assurance) Committee held on 15 March 2016.

3 ELECTION BUSINESS

NHS Lothian

The Council was informed of the resignation of Councillor Toner as the Council representative on NHS Lothian and was asked to agree that Councillor Cartmill be appointed as his replacement.

Audit and Governance Committee

The Council was informed of the resignation of Councillor Cartmill as Chair of Audit and Governance Committee and was asked to agree that Councillor Toner be appointed as his replacement.

Decision

1. To note the resignation of Councillor Toner as the Council representative on NHS Lothian and to agree the appointment of Councillor Cartmill as his replacement.
2. To note the resignation of Councillor Cartmill as Chair of Audit and Governance Committee and to agree the appointment of Councillor Toner as his replacement.

4. NOTICE OF MOTION - ST JOHN'S HOSPITAL - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR ANDERSON

Having declared an interest earlier in the meeting, Councillor Toner left the Chambers and took no part in consideration of this item of business.

“West Lothian Council SNP Group condemn the negative campaign run during the recent Holyrood Election by the Labour Party and in particular Neil Findlay. We note with concern the continuing scaremongering statements that have been made about ‘stopping the closure of the children’s ward’, ‘fighting the downgrade of St Johns’, all of which undermine the stability of the hospital. These campaigns are doing nothing to encourage staff to consider making their future at this great hospital.

The SNP Group also welcome all the additional funding which has been allocated to our Hospital recently and looks forward to a bright future for St John’s, with the further investment on the way to create a new elective surgical centre.

Council therefore writes to the Health Minister welcoming the additional resources and urging them to continue to ensure that the negativity ‘bandied about’ by the Labour Party does not diminish the reputation of our great Hospital and undermine its future stability.”

Moved by Councillor Anderson, seconded by Councillor Calder.

Amendment

“West Lothian Council commends the actions of West Lothian people in speaking out in defence of St John’s Hospital and in particular those who oppose the threat to downgrade the Children’s Ward at St John’s.

Council also commends the stance taken by Neil Findlay MSP, other local politicians, and those staff at St John’s who have also given a clear statement of their opposition to any downgrade of the Children’s Ward at St John’s.

Council recalls that the Children’s Ward at St Johns been allowed to close twice under the SNP Scottish Government since 2012, recalls that the SNP Group on West Lothian Council has repeatedly voted against motions calling for no downgrade of the Children’s Ward at St John’s, welcomes additional investment at St John’s Hospital, and agrees to oppose any downgrade of the Children’s Service at St Johns.”

Moved by Council Leader John McGinty, seconded by Councillor McMillan.

It was agreed that a roll call vote be taken which resulted as follows:-

<u>Motion</u>	<u>Amendment</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Frank Anderson	Stuart Borrowman	Tom Kerr
Diane Calder	Tony Boyle	
Janet Campbell	Harry Cartmill	
Robert De Bold	Tom Conn	
Jim Dickson	Alex Davidson	
Mary Dickson	Jim Dixon	
Carl John	David Dodds	
Sarah King	Lawrence Fitzpatrick	
Greg McCarra	Dave King	
Andrew Miller	Danny Logue	
David Tait	John McGinty	
Jim Walker	Anne McMillan	
	Angela Moohan	
	Cathy Muldoon	
	George Paul	
	Barry Robertson	

Decision

On a vote being taken, the amendment was successful by 16 votes to 12 votes, with 1 abstention, 1 member having left the Chambers and 3 members absent. The amendment was agreed accordingly.

5. NOTICE OF MOTION - CANCER STRATEGY - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

The Council considered a motion submitted by Councillor Campbell in the following terms:-

“West Lothian Council recognises the devastating impact a diagnosis of

cancer has on individuals, families and communities. This is a disease which touches every one of us and for some, has distressing and life changing outcomes. Research undertaken by Macmillan revealed that today 1 in 4 of us will be given this diagnosis and that by 2020 the number living with cancer will double to 4 million people. However further research has highlighted that by 2020, whilst 1 in 2 people will face this diagnosis, almost 4 in 10 of this will not die from this disease.

West Lothian Council therefore congratulates the Scottish Government for the Cancer Strategy outlined in the lead up to the recent Scottish Parliament election. The Scottish Government will invest £100 million in over 50 actions to improve cancer prevention, detection, diagnosis, treatment and aftercare. Good quality healthcare is the cornerstone of a decent society – this is a Government which has been given the mandate to provide this for Scotland. Patients in West Lothian deserve the best possible treatment for a cancer diagnosis – this is a Government determined to ensure that all patients receive the treatment they deserve.”

Moved by Councillor Campbell, seconded by Councillor Sarah King.

Amendment

“West Lothian Council welcomes any investment in NHS Scotland and the investment in a Cancer Strategy initiative is particularly welcome, however Council notes that the Scottish Government Cancer Strategy lagged behind those in other part of the UK.

Council notes that Scotland’s survival rates falls behind the rest of the UK and urgent steps should be taken by the Scottish Government to address this, particular in the gaps in staffing and expertise, which means, for example, some patients in parts of Scotland are missing out on the latest radiotherapy techniques. The Council would hope to see the Scottish Government taking a proactive approach to addressing health inequalities via the Cancer Strategy, especially with preventative measures such as the Breast Cancer Screening programme, where the uptake of this service in deprived areas, is much lower than in more affluent areas.

West Lothian Council recognises the challenges faced by the NHS staff who care for and treat individuals with cancer and that the staff should be congratulated on their consistent commitment and professionalism. The Council also recognises the invaluable level of help and support that the MacMillan Cancer Support provided in partnership with West Lothian Council and NHS Lothian.”

Moved by Councillor McMillan, seconded by Councillor McGinty.

It was agreed that a roll call vote be taken, which resulted as follows:-

<u>Motion</u>	<u>Amendment</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Frank Anderson	Stuart Borrowman	Tom Kerr
Diane Calder	Tony Boyle	
Janet Campbell	Harry Cartmill	
Robert De Bold	Tom Conn	

Jim Dickson	Alex Davidson
Mary Dickson	Jim Dixon
Carl John	David Dodds
Sarah King	Lawrence Fitzpatrick
Greg McCarra	Dave King
Andrew Miller	Danny Logue
David Tait	John McGinty
Jim Walker	Anne McMillan
	Angela Moohan
	Cathy Muldoon
	George Paul
	Barry Robertson
	Frank Toner

The amendment was successful by 17 votes to 12 votes, with 1 abstention and 3 members absent.

6. NOTICE OF MOTION - BATHGATE MENZIES CHOIR - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR MCGINTY

“West Lothian Council notes that the Bathgate Menzies Choir celebrates its 90th anniversary in 2016.

Council recall that the choir was originally known as the North British Steel Foundry Male Voice Choir and was established in 1926 in the midst of the economic depression and National Strike of that year, in order to provide activity for the steel foundry workers and an entertainment for the wider public.

The change of name to the Bathgate Menzies Choir took place in 1996 and continued the fine work of the Choir whilst recognising the close links between the Choir and the Menzies family.

West Lothian Council congratulates all at the Bathgate Menzies Choir on 90 years of musical excellence, commends their outstanding contribution to choral music in the West Lothian area, and welcomes the continuing presence in serving the community of Bathgate and wider West Lothian.

Council agrees to ask the Provost to write to the Bathgate Menzies Choir to pass on the congratulations of the Council on their 90th anniversary.”

Moved by Council Leader John McGinty.

Decision

To unanimously approve the terms of the motion.

7. NOTICE OF MOTION - ROYAL COLLEGE OF PAEDIATRICIANS AND CHILD HEALTH REPORT - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR MCGINTY

The Council considered a motion submitted by Council Leader John McGinty in the following terms:-

“West Lothian Council notes that the NHS Lothian commissioned Royal College of Paediatricians and Child Health report into paediatric services across Lothian is scheduled to be considered by the NHS Lothian Board in June 2016.

Council restates its view that it will not accept any reduction in the Children’s Ward provision at St John’s Hospital, commends the continuing hard work of the staff team at St John’s, calls upon the Scottish Government Cabinet Secretary with responsibility for Health to give an immediate undertaking that they will veto any proposal to reduce services at the St John’s Children’s Ward contained in the Royal College report, and agrees to write to the First Minister and the Cabinet Secretary with responsibility for Health setting out the Council’s position.”

Moved by Council Leader John McGinty, seconded by Councillor McMillan.

Amendment

“West Lothian Council SNP Group condemn the totally negative and scaremongering ‘campaign’ perpetuated by the Labour Group on this Council with regards to St John’s Hospital. Never at any time has there been a motion from the Labour Group welcoming the huge investment in our hospital.

The Labour Group failed when given the opportunity during the review just finished, to put forward an alternative positive case for why services should be retained at St John’s. Instead, their constant scaremongering has undermined the hospital, staff and caused undue concern within West Lothian.

The SNP Group urges Council to await the outcome of the review and writes to the Health Minister welcoming the additional resources invested in our Hospital.”

Moved by Councillor Anderson, seconded by Councillor Calder.

It was agreed that a roll call vote be taken, which resulted as follows:-

<u>Motion</u>	<u>Amendment</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Stuart Borrowman	Frank Anderson	Tom Kerr
Tony Boyle	Diane Calder	
Harry Cartmill	Janet Campbell	
Tom Conn	Robert De Bold	
Alex Davidson	Jim Dickson	
Jim Dixon	Mary Dickson	
David Dodds	Carl John	
Lawrence Fitzpatrick	Sarah King	
Dave King	Greg McCarra	
Danny Logue	Andrew Miller	
John McGinty	David Tait	
Anne McMillan	Jim Walker	

Angela Moohan
Cathy Muldoon
George Paul
Barry Robertson
Frank Toner

Decision

On a vote being taken, the motion was successful by 17 votes to 12 votes, with 1 abstention and 3 members absent. The motion was agreed accordingly.

8. DOCUMENTS FOR EXECUTION

The Chief Solicitor presented 169 documents for execution.

Decision

That the deeds be executed.

9. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPROVEMENTS, TORPHICHEN AND WESTFIELD - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR THE ENVIRONMENT SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR BORROWMAN

A written question to the Executive Councillor for the Environment had been submitted by Councillor Borrowman in the following terms:-

“At the Council by-election in Armadale and Blackridge Ward in March 2015, the Scottish Labour candidate issued a leaflet including “local promises.”

These included “environmental upgrades in Torphichen and Westfield.”

What are these and what is the timetable for delivery?”

The Executive Councillor for the Environment provided a verbal answer to the written question.

Decision

To note the written question put and verbal answer given.

10. REVIEW OF THE PLANNING AUTHORITY - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR DEVELOPMENT AND TRANSPORT SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR BORROWMAN

A written question to the Executive Councillor for Development and Transport had been submitted by Councillor Borrowman in the following

terms:-

“In May 2012, Labour made a commitment to an independent review of the Council’s role as planning authority.

1. On what date was the review commissioned?
2. On what date was the draft report received?”

The Executive Councillor for Development and Transport proved a verbal answer to the written question.

Councillor Borrowman indicated that he wished to put supplementary questions as provided for in standing orders. He did so and the Executive Councillor for Development and Transport provided a verbal answer to the supplementary questions.

Decision

1. To note the written question put and verbal answer given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and verbal answers given.

11. COUNCIL HOUSEBUILDING - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR SERVICES FOR THE COMMUNITY SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR BORROWMAN

A written question to the Executive Councillor for Services for the Community had been circulated by Councillor Borrowman in the following terms:-

“In May 2012, Labour committed to “build a minimum of 1,000 new council houses” by end-April 2017. Since May 2012:

How many new council houses have been completed and let to tenants?

Of these, how many are in each ward?

For how many others has an effective site start been made?

Of these, how many are in each ward?

How many will be completed and let to tenants by end-April 2017?

How many of these will be in each ward?”

The Executive Councillor for Services for the Community provided a verbal answer to the written question.

Councillor Borrowman indicated that he wished to put supplementary questions as provided for in standing orders. He did so and the Executive Councillor for Services for the Community provided verbal answers to the supplementary questions.

Decision

1. To note the written question put and verbal answer given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and verbal answers given.

12. NEW BUILD HOUSES - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR SERVICES FOR THE COMMUNITY SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR ANDERSON

A written question to the Executive Councillor for Services for the Community had been submitted by Councillor Anderson in the following terms:-

“As 4 years have passed from the Council Elections, and to enable you to be more specific in your reply, could you tell us how many of the following homes are occupied by tenants. These were the sites identified as creating your party’s 1000 new build houses.

Adelaide St
West Main St, Broxburn
Wester Inch, Bathgate
Redhouse
Infant school, Pumpherston
Kirkhill, Broxburn
Lammermuir, Livingston
Almond Link, Livingston
Nelson Park, Armadale
Glasgow Road, Bathgate
Eastfield, Fauldhouse
Drumshoreland
Winchburgh CDA
Auldhill, Bridgend
Deans South
Mill Rd, Linlithgow Bridge
Almondvale Stadium, Livingston
Appleton Parkway, Livingston
Almondell, East Calder
Raw Holdings, East Calder
Philipstoun
Mayfield, Armadale
Bathville, Armadale”

The Executive Councillor for Services for the Community provided a verbal answer to the written question.

Councillor Anderson indicated that he wished put supplementary questions as provided for in standing orders. He did so and the Executive Councillor for Services for the Community provided verbal answers to the supplementary question.

Decision

1. To note the written question put and verbal answer given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and verbal answers given.