

MINUTE of MEETING of the WEST LoTHIAN COUNCIL held within Council Chambers, West Lothian Civic Centre, Livingston, on 12 May 2015.

Present – Provost Tom Kerr (Chair), Depute Provost Dave King, Council Leader John McGinty, Councillors Frank Anderson, Stuart Borrowman, Tony Boyle, William Boyle, Diane Calder, Janet Campbell, Harry Cartmill, Tom Conn, Alexander Davidson, Robert De Bold, Jim Dickson, Mary Dickson, Jim Dixon, David Dodds, Lawrence Fitzpatrick, Carl John, Peter Johnston, Sarah King, Danny Logue, Greg McCarra, Anne McMillan, Andrew Miller, Angela Moohan, John Muir, Cathy Muldoon, George Paul, Barry Robertson, Frank Toner, Jim Walker

Apologies – Councillor Martyn Day

1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members declared interests as undernoted:-

Councillor Toner declared a non-financial interest as a Non-Executive Director, NHS Lothian and as Chair of West Lothian CHCP.

Councillor Johnston declared a non-financial interest in agenda item 7 arising from the following positions held:-

- Non-Executive Director of NHS Lothian.
- COSLA Spokesperson (Health and Wellbeing)
- Non-Executive Director, Health Improvement Scotland

Councillor Logue declared a non-financial interest in agenda item 7 as an employee of NHS Lothian.

2. MINUTES

- (a) The Council approved the minute of meeting of West Lothian Council held on 31 March 2015.
- (b) The Council noted correspondence arising from previous decisions.
- (c) The Council noted the minute of meeting of the Employee Appeals Committee held on 16 January 2015.
- (d) The Council noted the minute of meeting of the Employee Appeals Committee held on 6 February 2015.
- (e) The Council noted the minute of meeting of the Education (Quality Assurance) Committee held on 3 March 2015.



### 3. ELECTION BUSINESS

The Council was informed by the SNP Group Leader that membership on various committees and Policy Development and Scrutiny Panels had been reviewed by the SNP Group.

The Council was asked to approve proposed changes to membership as undernoted:-

#### Education Executive

Sarah King  
Andrew Miller  
Carl John  
James Walker

#### Education (Quality Assurance)

Andrew Miller  
Carl John  
Sarah King

#### Environment PDSP

Diane Calder  
Greg McCarra

#### Partnership and Resources PDSP

Peter Johnston  
Greg McCarra

#### Development and Transport PDSP

Robert De Bold  
Greg McCarra

#### Licensing Committee

Jim Walker  
John Muir

#### West Lothian Leisure Advisory Committee

Jim Walker  
Carl John

#### Decision

To approve the changes to membership in relation to SNP Group members.



4. NOTICE OF MOTION - WEST LoTHIAN COUNCIL ALLOTMENT STRATEGY - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR JOHNSTON

The Council considered a motion submitted by Councillor Johnston in the following terms:-

“Council notes that the current Allotment Strategy sets out the council’s proposals and intention to;

Embrace community participation and act as a facilitator in the management of allotment gardens.” \*Allotments Strategy page 5 1.3

“by facilitating and enabling communities to actively manage and participate in allotment gardening.” \*Allotments Strategy page 3 Executive Summary

“These associations will independently manage their respective allotment gardens addressing all day to day issues relating to tenants’ leases, rent collection, finance, maintenance and enforcement.” \*Allotments Strategy page 3 Executive Summary

“West Lothian Council will, in return, facilitate and support each association to ensure a high quality and accountable management service is delivered to the community of West Lothian.” \*Allotments Strategy page 3 Executive Summary

Council accepts that the clear intention of the Allotment Strategy is to empower formally constituted allotment associations to “independently” manage all issues relating to tenants’ leases and further accepts that to deliver the aims and intentions set out above that it is essential for such associations to have the powers to do this.

Council therefore agrees that all decisions in respect of allotment plots, including decisions in respect of the keeping of poultry, animals or any livestock are best made by formally constituted allotment associations and therefore further agrees to amend the current Allotment Strategy to facilitate this position.”

Moved by Councillor Johnston, seconded by Councillor De Bold.

Amendment

“Council notes that the West Lothian Council Allotment Strategy, as part of the Council’s Open Space Strategy, was approved by the Council Executive on 28<sup>th</sup> September 2010.

The Allotment Strategy and Open Space Strategy are 5 year strategies which will be refreshed before the end of the financial year.

Council therefore resolves that any review should include the practicalities and related issues of keeping poultry, animals or any livestock being permitted and present the conclusions, at the appropriate time, to a meeting of the Environment PDSP.”

Moved by Councillor Conn, seconded by Councillor Robertson.



It was agreed that a roll call vote be taken, which resulted as follows:-

<u>Motion</u>	<u>Amendment</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Frank Anderson	Tony Boyle	Stuart Borrowman
Willie Boyle	Harry Cartmill	
Diane Calder	Tom Conn	
Janet Campbell	Alex Davidson	
Robert De Bold	Jim Dixon	
Jim Dickson	David Dodds	
Mary Dickson	Lawrence Fitzpatrick	
Carl John	Tom Kerr	
Peter Johnston	Dave King	
Sarah King	Danny Logue	
Greg McCarra	Anne McMillan	
Andrew Miller	John McGinty	
John Muir	Angela Moohan	
Jim Walker	Cathy Muldoon	
	George Paul	
	Barry Robertson	
	Frank Toner	

### Decision

The amendment was successful by 17 votes to 14 votes, with 1 abstention and 1 member absent. The amendment was agreed accordingly.

### 5. NOTICE OF MOTION - CUTS TO HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE SERVICES - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

The Council considered a motion submitted by Councillor Campbell in the following terms:-

“West Lothian Council SNP Group deplores the decision made by the Better Together Administration to remove £1.2M and 25 jobs from the Health & Social Care Services budget. Removal of this level of funding, coupled with skilled personnel will only help to create further health inequalities within our communities.

West Lothian Council accepts that these services support some of the most vulnerable and marginalised people living in our communities. To impose such savage cuts as are proposed, without holding full, transparent and detailed discussions with key stakeholders is inherently wrong and cannot be acceptable in a socially just society.

West Lothian Council resolves to instruct officers, as a matter of urgency, to prepare a report detailing the full impact of these cuts to services providing vital support for some of the most vulnerable and marginalised people living in our communities, and agrees that this report will be submitted to the next meeting of West Lothian Council.”



Moved by Councillor Campbell, seconded by Councillor Calder.

### Amendment

“The council is focused on delivering efficiencies whilst protecting priority services. The integration of health and care offers significant opportunities to streamline services between the currently separate agencies.

This will result in efficiency savings by:

- Redesign of patient/client care pathways – removing duplication and integrating
- Processes (including information systems)
- Streamlined management, again removing duplication
- Reduced bureaucracy
- Reduced overhead, for example through more efficient use of property

We ask this council to write to the SNP Scottish Government for more funding for these services.”

Moved by Councillor Logue, seconded by Councillor McMillan.

It was agreed that a roll call vote be taken, which resulted as follows:-

<u>Motion</u>	<u>Amendment</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Frank Anderson	Tony Boyle	Stuart Borrowman
Willie Boyle	Harry Cartmill	
Diane Calder	Tom Conn	
Janet Campbell	Alex Davidson	
Robert De Bold	Jim Dixon	
Jim Dickson	David Dodds	
Mary Dickson	Lawrence Fitzpatrick	
Carl John	Tom Kerr	
Peter Johnston	Dave King	
Sarah King	Danny Logue	
Greg McCarra	Anne McMillan	
Andrew Miller	John McGinty	
John Muir	Angela Moohan	
Jim Walker	Cathy Muldoon	
	George Paul	
	Barry Robertson	
	Frank Toner	

### Decision

The amendment was successful by 17 votes to 14 votes, with 1 abstention and 1 member absent. The amendment was agreed accordingly.



6. NOTICE OF MOTION - JIM O'HARA - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

The Council considered a motion submitted by Councillor Campbell in the following terms:-

“West Lothian Council would like to commend the bravery and quick thinking of Council employee Jim O'Hara of Winchburgh. Without the actions of Jim and Paddy McCourt, lives could have been lost in the early hours of Thursday April 9<sup>th</sup>.

Jim, who was letting Paddy McCourt out at 1.30 am, saw flames, which had leapt 12ft up the wall of his neighbour's house. A wheelie bin had been set on fire, the flames from this fire were perilously close to the gas mains for the whole row of homes.

Jim woke the family inside before raising the alarm with the Fire Brigade. He then led 38 of his fellow neighbours to the safety of the Community Hall whilst the Fire Brigade extinguished the flames.

West Lothian Council therefore resolves to write to Jim O'Hara commending him for his quick thinking and for his actions in opening the Community Hall and leading his neighbours to safety. Special mention should be made to Paddy McCourt, who helped to save his neighbours following what could have been a devastating fire in this small community.”

Moved by Councillor Campbell.

The Council then heard Councillor Campbell propose that the Council recommends Paddy McCourt for an animal bravery medal.

Decision

To unanimously approve the terms of the motion and that, in addition, the Council recommends Paddy McCourt for an animal bravery medal.

7. NOTICE OF MOTION - BARNETT FORMULA - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR MCGINTY

“West Lothian Council notes with concern the proposals made during the election campaign by the SNP and UKIP to abolish the Barnett Formula.

Council agrees that the retention of the Barnett Formula is in the best interest of Scotland's economy and the people of Scotland, agrees to oppose any proposal to abolish the Barnett Formula, and agrees to write to West Lothian MP's, MSP's and Lothian List MSP's setting out the Council's view.”

Moved by Council Leader John McGinty, seconded by Councillor Muldoon.



Amendment

“West Lothian Council asserts that the Scottish Parliament is best placed to make all decisions affecting Scotland, including decisions on our economy, financial resources, employment, Minimum wage, Living Wage and welfare.

Council notes that during the recent Westminster General Election the Scottish National Party strongly argued against the continuing austerity proposals from both Conservative and Labour parties and strongly argued for a substantial increase in the powers of the Scottish Parliament, the non-replacement of Trident, for investment in our NHS and public services, for investment to create new jobs and growth in our economy, for substantial increases in the minimum wage and protection for the weak and vulnerable in our society by ensuring adequate welfare benefits.

Council accepts that the people of Scotland have overwhelmingly endorsed the progressive politics advanced by the Scottish National Party, electing 2 SNP West Lothian MP's and 56 SNP MP's out of 59 at a national level and resolves to;

- Congratulate all council staff for the highly professional manner in which the election process was managed locally.
- Congratulate Martyn Day on his election as SNP MP for Linlithgow and Falkirk East with a swing from Labour of 22.7% and a majority of 12,934.
- Congratulate Hannah Bardell on her election as SNP MP for Livingston with a swing from Labour of 25.9% and a majority of 16,843.
- Congratulate all 59 of Scotland's MPs on their election.

Council further accepts that the people of Scotland have overwhelmingly endorsed the call from the Scottish National Party for the Scottish Parliament to be given all powers necessary to end the Westminster parties' austerity regime, to remove trident, to ensure we can grow our economy and create jobs, invest in our NHS and public services and protect the weak and vulnerable in our society by delivering adequate welfare benefits.”

Moved by Councillor Johnston, seconded by Councillor McCarra.

It was agreed that a roll call vote be taken, which resulted as follows:-

<u>Motion</u>	<u>Amendment</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Stuart Borrowman	Frank Anderson	Tom Kerr
Tony Boyle	Willie Boyle	
Harry Cartmill	Diane Calder	
Tom Conn	Janet Campbell	
Alex Davidson	Robert De Bold	



Jim Dixon	Jim Dickson
David Dodds	Mary Dickson
Lawrence Fitzpatrick	Carl John
Dave King	Peter Johnston
Danny Logue	Sarah King
Anne McMillan	Greg McCarra
John McGinty	Andrew Miller
Angela Moohan	John Muir
Cathy Muldoon	Jim Walker
George Paul	
Barry Robertson	
Frank Toner	

### Decision

The motion was successful by 17 votes to 14 votes, with 1 abstention and 1 member absent. The motion was agreed accordingly.

## 8. NOTICE OF MOTION - SNP U-TURN - CORROBORATION IN CRIMINAL CASES - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR DODDS

“Council welcomes the announcement by Michael Matheson that the Scottish Government is finally dropping its proposed legislation to abolish the need for corroboration in criminal cases.

Council takes the view that the proposed legislation on corroboration was the latest in a long line of the SNP Government forcing through hurried and ill-considered legislation in the face of opposition from stakeholders, including experts in their fields.

Council calls on the SNP to consult widely and to listen to opinions that do not agree with their own when bringing forward revised proposals for the justice system and to extend this to all future legislation.”

Moved by Councillor Dodds, seconded by Councillor Fitzpatrick.

### Amendment

“West Lothian Council welcomes Justice Secretary, Michael Matheson’s recent announcement to review the Scottish Government’s proposed legislation to abolish corroboration in crimes such as sexual assault and rape.

Council notes that the SNP Government put forward the proposal to abolish the general requirement for corroboration for a very good reason – to see more people who commit crimes in private – crimes such as sexual assault and rape – brought to trial and, if found guilty brought to justice.

Council applauds the fact that the SNP Scottish Government’s absolute dedication to protecting vulnerable people has not changed. Council notes that it is largely women and children and the frail and the vulnerable who suffer behind closed doors.



Council notes that the former justice secretary listened to the serious and genuine concerns that were being raised, which is why he asked Lord Bonython to carry out the work that he has now completed and further notes that a range of changes have been recommended to the justice system and that the justice secretary, rightly and properly, has decided that we need to pause and consider those reforms.

Council further notes that the Labour Manifesto in 2011 said they would abolish corroboration for rape and sexual offences. Council further notes Labour went back on that commitment following their shameful Better Together alliance and that Labour are now opposing – not just their own manifesto, police and prosecutors – but are pitted against Rape Crisis Scotland, Victims Support Scotland and even charities for the elderly.

Council notes the Labour argument that when the SNP Government presses ahead with a plan, that is steamrolling and when they take the chance to listen, reflect and admit that a proposal might not have got everything right, that is described as a U turn.

Council dismisses this Labour argument and accepts that the SNP Scottish Government has done the responsible and sensible thing.

Council asserts that our justice system must provide the appropriate balance, so that the rights of suspects, victims and witnesses all get the protections they deserve. It must, as far as possible, be fair to all.

Council welcomes the recent First Minister announced funding of £20M over three years which to speed up the processing of cases through the courts, support victims and tackle the behaviour of perpetrators to stop re-offending. Council acknowledges that this funding has been widely welcomed by victims' organisations.

Council further welcomes the commitment from the SNP Scottish Government to continue to work with victims' organisations to protect victims' rights, improve access to justice and continue to tackle the scourge of sexual and private space violence in Scotland."

Moved by Councillor Johnston, seconded by Councillor McCarra.

It was agreed that a roll call vote be taken, which resulted as follows:-

<u>Motion</u>	<u>Amendment</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Stuart Borrowman	Frank Anderson	
Tony Boyle	Willie Boyle	
Harry Cartmill	Diane Calder	
Tom Conn	Janet Campbell	
Alex Davidson	Robert De Bold	
Jim Dixon	Jim Dickson	
David Dodds	Mary Dickson	
Lawrence Fitzpatrick	Carl John	
Tom Kerr	Peter Johnston	
Dave King	Sarah King	



Danny Logue  
Anne McMillan  
John McGinty  
Angela Moohan  
Cathy Muldoon  
George Paul  
Barry Robertson  
Frank Toner

Greg McCarra  
Andrew Miller  
John Muir  
Jim Walker

Decision

The motion was successful by 18 votes to 14 votes, with 1 member absent. The motion was agreed accordingly.

9. DOCUMENTS FOR EXECUTION

The Chief Solicitor presented 69 documents for execution.

Decision

That the deeds be executed.

10. VACANT POSTS - QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL -  
SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR JOHNSTON

A written question to the Leader of the Council had been submitted by Councillor Johnston in the following terms:-

“Please provide full details for the following;

Current number of vacant posts broken down by service area.

Current Length of each vacancy.

Current estimate of savings for each vacancy.”

The Leader of the Council provided a verbal answer to the written question.

Councillor Johnston indicated that he wished to put supplementary questions as provided for in Standing Orders. He did so, and the Council Leader provided a verbal answer to the first supplementary question and undertook to provide Councillor Johnston with an answer to his second supplementary question in due course.

Decision

1. To note the written questions put and verbal answers given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and verbal answer given to the first supplementary question.
3. To note that the Council Leader would provide a written answer to



the second supplementary question in due course.

11. AUTISM INITIATIVES - QUESTION TO THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL  
- SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

A written question to the Leader of the Council had been submitted by Councillor Campbell in the following terms:-

“Please explain why your administration has removed the funding from Autism Initiatives to provide their weekly club for young people with autism at Almond House in Livingston.”

The Leader of the Council provided a verbal answer to the written question.

Councillor Campbell indicated that that she wished to put supplementary questions as provided for in Standing Orders. She did so, and the Council Leader provided an answer to the second supplementary question and undertook to provide an answer to the first supplementary question in due course.

Decision

1. To note the written question put and verbal answer given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and answer given to the second supplementary question.
3. To note that the Council Leader would provide an answer to the first supplementary question in due course.

12. WASTE COLLECTION - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE  
COUNCILLOR FOR THE ENVIRONMENT - SUBMITTED BY  
COUNCILLOR CALDER

A written question to the Executive Councillor for the Environment had been submitted by Councillor Calder in the following terms:-

“On January 29<sup>th</sup> you voted for a proposal to cut £353,000 and 6 jobs through “optimisation of waste collection routes and a revised schedule for grey bin collections.”

Can you now detail:

1. The revised frequency of grey bin collection required to deliver this cut.
2. The staffing cuts required to deliver the saving you have voted for.”

The Executive Councillor for the Environment provided a verbal answer to the written question.



Councillor Calder indicated that she wished to put supplementary questions as provided for in Standing Orders. She did so, and the Executive Councillor provided verbal answers to the supplementary questions.

Decision

1. To note the written questions put and verbal answers given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and verbal answers given.

13. CONCESSIONARY RAIL SCHEME - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR DEVELOPMENT AND TRANSPORT - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR DE BOLD

A written question to the Executive Councillor for Development and Transport had been submitted by Councillor De Bold in the following terms:-

“On January 29<sup>th</sup> you voted for a proposal to cut £272,000 in 2015/16 through “negotiation of a revised concessionary rail scheme.”

1. Given that the budget for 2015/16 has been cut by 57% does that mean that the rail concession will also be cut by 57%?
2. When will the reduced concessionary scheme be introduced?”

The Executive Councillor for Development and Transport provided verbal answers to the written questions.

Councillor De Bold indicated that he wished to put supplementary questions as provided for in Standing Orders. He did so, and the Executive Councillor provided verbal answers to the supplementary questions.

Decision

1. To note the written questions put and verbal answers given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and verbal answers given.

14. COMMUNITY CARE SERVICES - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR SOCIAL POLICY - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR MUIR

A Question to the Executive Councillor for Social Policy had been submitted by Councillor Muir in the following terms:-

“On January 29<sup>th</sup> you voted for a proposal to cut £1.435m from the council’s social care budgets by changing levels of access to care and by



imposing charges for community care services.

Can you now detail exactly

1. What services will be charged for
2. What level of charges are to be imposed
3. How many people currently receiving services will lose these services to deliver this cut.

The Executive Councillor for Social Policy provided verbal answers to the written questions.

Councillor Muir indicated that he wished to put a supplementary question as provided for in Standing Orders. He did so, and the Executive Councillor for Social Policy provided a verbal answer to his supplementary question.

#### Decision

1. To note the written questions put and verbal answers given.
2. To note the supplementary question put and verbal answer given.

15. STRATHBROCK PARTNERSHIP CENTRE - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR HEALTH AND CARE - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

A written question to the Executive Councillor for Health and Care had been submitted by Councillor Campbell in the following terms:-

“On January 29<sup>th</sup> you voted for a proposal to cut £40,000 and 2 jobs from the Strathbrock Partnership centre through the introduction of an “administration model.”

Can you now detail exactly

1. Which 2 posts are to be removed?
2. What services, currently provided through these 2 posts, will no longer be delivered?

The Executive Councillor for Health and Care provided verbal answers to the written questions.

Councillor Campbell indicated that she wished to put supplementary questions as provided for in Standing Orders. She did so, and the Executive Councillor for Health and Care provided verbal answers to the supplementary questions.

#### Decision

1. To note the written questions put and verbal answers given.



2. To note the supplementary questions put and verbal answers given.

16. HOMELESSNESS - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR SERVICES FOR THE COMMUNITY - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR ANDERSON

A written Question to the Executive Councillor for Services for the Community had been submitted by Councillor Anderson in the following terms:-

“On January 29<sup>th</sup> you voted for a proposal to cut £66,000 and 2 jobs through “efficiencies arising from preventative interventions in homelessness.”

Can you now detail what these preventative interventions will be and confirm which two posts are to be cut?”

The Executive Councillor for Services for the Community provided a verbal answer to the written question.

Councillor Anderson indicated that he wished to put a supplementary question as provided for in Standing Orders. He did so, and the Executive Councillor for Services for the Community undertook to provide Councillor Anderson with written answers to the two supplementary questions in due course.

Decision

1. To note the written question put and verbal answer given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and that a written response to the two supplementary questions would be provided to Councillor Anderson in due course.

17. HEALTH IMPROVEMENT TEAM - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR HEALTH AND CARE - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

Written questions to the Executive Councillor for Health and Care had been submitted by Councillor Campbell in the following terms:-

“On January 29<sup>th</sup> you voted for a proposal to cut £50,000 and 1 job from the council’s Health Improvement team.

Can you now detail exactly

1. Which post is to be removed?
2. What services, currently provided will no longer be delivered?”

The Executive Councillor for Health and Care provided verbal answers to



the written questions.

Councillor Campbell indicated that she wished to put supplementary questions as provided for in Standing Orders. She did so and the Executive Councillor for Health and Care provided verbal answers to the supplementary questions.

#### Decision

1. To note the written questions put and verbal answers given.
2. To note the supplementary questions put and verbal answers given.

18. PRIMARY SCHOOL DEVOLVED BUDGETS - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR EDUCATION - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR MILLER

A written Question to the Executive Councillor for Education had been submitted by Councillor Miller in the following terms:-

“On January 29<sup>th</sup> you voted for a proposal to cut £1.544m from the primary school devolved budgets along with 39 jobs.

Can you now detail exactly what changes are to be made to deliver this cut and which jobs are to be lost.”

The Executive Councillor for Education provided a verbal answer to the written question.

#### Decision

To note the written question put and verbal answer given.

19. PRE SCHOOL PROVISION - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR EDUCATION - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR MILLER

A written question to the Executive Councillor for Education had been submitted by Councillor Miller in the following terms:-

“On January 29<sup>th</sup> you voted for a proposal to cut £504,000 from the budget for pre school provision.

Can you now detail exactly what changes are to be made to deliver this cut.”

The Executive Councillor for Education provided a verbal answer to the written question.

#### Decision

To note the question put and verbal answer given.



20. CLEANING SPECIFICATION - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR EDUCATION - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR MILLER

The Chair had ruled earlier in the meeting that, in accordance with Standing Order 18 (9), the total time allowed for all questions and answers would not be more than 30 minutes. This matter was therefore not considered as the 30 minutes had elapsed.

21. ENVIRONMENTAL UPGRADES IN WESTFIELD AND TORPHICHEN - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR THE ENVIRONMENT - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR BORROWMAN

The Chair had ruled earlier in the meeting that, in accordance with Standing Order 18 (9), the total time allowed for all questions and answers would not be more than 30 minutes. This matter was therefore not considered as the 30 minutes had elapsed.

22. PRIMARY SCHOOL PLACES IN ARMADALE - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR EDUCATION - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR STUART BORROWMAN

The Chair had ruled earlier in the meeting that, in accordance with Standing Order 18 (9), the total time allowed for all questions and answers would not be more than 30 minutes. This matter was therefore not considered as the 30 minutes had elapsed.

23. USE OF DEVELOPER CONTRIBUTIONS - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR DEVELOPMENT AND TRANSPORT - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR BORROWMAN

The Chair had ruled earlier in the meeting that, in accordance with Standing Order 18 (9), the total time allowed for all questions and answers would not be more than 30 minutes. This matter was therefore not considered as the 30 minutes had elapsed.

24. COUNCIL HOUSING REFURBISHMENT AND REPAIRS IN ARMADALE - QUESTION TO THE EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR FOR SERVICES FOR THE COMMUNITY - SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR BORROWMAN

The Chair had ruled earlier in the meeting that, in accordance with Standing Order 18 (9), the total time allowed for all questions and answers would not be more than 30 minutes. This matter was therefore not considered as the 30 minutes had elapsed.