MINUTE of MEETING of the PERFORMANCE COMMITTEE held within COUNCIL CHAMBERS, WEST LOTHIAN CIVIC CENTRE, on 18 MARCH 2019.

Present – Councillors Stuart Borrowman (Chair), Andrew McGuire, Carl John, Charles Kennedy, Dave King, Carl John

1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest made.

2. MINUTE

The Committee confirmed the Minute of its meeting held on 4 February 2019 as a correct record. The Minute was thereafter signed by the Chair.

3. SERVICE PERFORMANCE AND WLAM OUTCOME REPORT - ROADS AND TRANSPORTATION

The Committee considered a report (copies of which had been circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive providing an overview of a service assessment from the West Lothian Assessment Model process (WLAM 2017/20).

The report also provided a summary of recommendations from the officer led panel that had been identified for action and were to be delivered by the service management team.

The report advised that self-assessment was an important part of the council's Best Value Framework, ensuring that there was rigorous challenge of performance and continuous improvement embedded at all levels of the organisation. Regular, programmed self-assessment was also an integral part of improvement planning and preparation for external inspections.

The report provided the outcome from the self-assessment of Roads and Transportation and the agreed recommendations for improvement for the service as well as a summary overview of performance.

The West Lothian Assessment Model applied an evidence based rigorous model – the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) Framework. This required employees to consider the long-term impact of the service in the stated objectives.

The Depute Chief Executive explained that Roads and Transportation provided an integrated service to construct, manage and maintain the road, footpath and transportation network in West Lothian. The service managed and maintained over 1,043 km of public roadway, 1,390 km of public footpath, 48,193 street lights, 163 traffic light installations, 2,419 grit bins, 11, 295 illuminated and non-illuminated signs and bollards, 578

bridges and other structures.

The main activities of the service were to manage, maintain and improve public roads and footpaths, flood risk management, provide transport planning and a development control service. Appendix 1 to the report contained a summary of the service activities.

The report went on to advise that Roads and Transportation was part of Operational Services which delivered a wide array of activities including the provision of environmental and road services. This was a large and valued frontline service for the community and had a key asset planning and management role within the council, in respect of road, land and fleet assets.

The service made a critical contribution to the council's corporate priorities 7 and 8 as follows:

- Priority 7.6 – Reducing the casualty rates from fires and road traffic collisions by continuing to work in partnership with Fire and Rescue Services, and Police Scotland through enforcement, engineering, education and effective early interventions.

- Priority 8.4 – Maintaining roads network to support and sustain economic and population growth in the local area. Engaging with the community and commercial operators to deliver a cost effective public transport network and active travel options.

The service went through the West Lothian Assessment Model process in 2018/19 with a representative group of employees from the service critically evaluating the service effectiveness in the nine criterion parts of the assessment model. The service scored 529.

Table 1 contained an overview of the service's score in the last four cycles. The trend column was based on a comparison between the base position and the current WLAM score.

The Review Panel in the WLAM Programme 2017/20 had three possible outcomes that would identify the progress and risk level of service performance and subsequently the level of scrutiny that would be applied to the service during the period of the WLAM programme. Table 2 provided the outcome of the Review Panel. Table 3 contained the evaluation of Performance Management in the service.

The Review Panel set out the following recommendations for the service:-

1. The Panel recognised the work that had been ongoing in the service to improve employee engagement, communication and satisfaction levels.

2. The Panel encouraged the service to look to the market and good practice in other authorities in the application of technology in Roads, Transportation Services. The focus of scrutiny related to how the service was currently using mobile devices to increase agility, and management systems that could support capital

improvement works.

3. The panel recommended that the service continue to build on improvements in relation to communications that had been put in place around winter activities and services.

4. The Panel recommended that the service continue to build resilience for winter activities and services, in particular that the use of volunteer schemes was reviewed to increase support in the community during severe weather.

5. The service should introduce the National Highways and Transportation customer survey results as performance indicators.

6. The panel recommended that the service continue to identify new methods of engaging with customers to improve customer satisfaction.

7. The Panel recommended that the service continue to investigate and resolve any issues that were contributing to the staff survey results in relation to equality.

8. The service should continue to regularly review targets and thresholds providing clear target setting rationale.

9. The Panel recommended that the service continue to pursue opportunities for benchmarking with other bodies of local authorities.

An overview of the performance indicators categorised as Public or High Level were included in Appendix 2 to the report.

The service had five indicators in the Local Government Benchmark Framework that were aligned with the activity of Community Care. The data for 2017/18 had not yet been published however the performance and ranking information for 2016/17 was as follows:

- <u>SENVO4a – Cost of maintenance per kilometre of roads.</u>

  WLC had an average cost of £14,260 per kilometre in 2017/18. This cost was higher than the Scottish average of £10,546 and ranked at 21 (out of 32) overall in Scotland

- <u>SENVO4b – Percentage of A class road that should be considered for maintenance treatment</u>

  WLC had performance of 21/6 percent in 2017/18. This was above the Scottish average of 30.2 percent and ranked at 6 (out of 32) overall in Scotland.

- <u>SENVO4c – Percentage of B class roads that should be considered for maintenance treatment.</u>

  WLC had performance of 30.7 percent in 2017/18. This was above

the Scottish average of 35.9 percent and ranked at 15 (out of 32) overall in Scotland.

- SENVO4d – Percentage of C class roads that should be considered for maintenance treatment.

  WLC had performance of 45.1 percent in 2017/18. This was below the Scottish average of 36.2 percent and ranked at 28 (out of 32) overall in Scotland.

- SENVO4e – Percentage of Unclassified roads that should be considered for maintenance treatment

  WLC had performance of 28.1 percent in 2017/18. This was above the Scottish average of 39 percent and ranked at 2 (out of 32) overall in Scotland.

In conclusion it was advised that Roads and Transportation completed the WLAM process as part of the council's corporate programme of self-assessment. This helped to ensure that excellent practice and performance was supported and that the principle of continuous improvement was adopted in all council services.

The report recommended that the Committee:-

1. Note the outcome from the WLAM and Review Panel process;

2. Note the recommendations for improvement;

3. Agree any other recommendations that may improve the performance of the service.

The Committee then asked a number of questions in relation to the standard and quality of road repairs, road speed limit signs, flooding issues and public engagement.

The officer explained that there was a roads inspection programme to ensure that defects were recorded on to the system and scheduled into the works programme. It was explained that each defect noted from the inspection was recorded and initially made safe using temporary materials of a quality that could withstand a number of months wear. The work was thereafter scheduled into the work program for follow on repairs.

The officer also undertook to investigate a number of issues raised by members with regard to particular areas of concern in relation to temporary road repairs, flooding, and the lack of speed limit signs.

With regard to public engagement and communication It was advised that the council had robust processes in place to inform the public when road closures and works were due to commence, including use of the media, council website, social media, and advising other services within the council. It was also explained that co-ordination was easier when works were being carried out by West Lothian Council as opposed to another party being involved such as utility companies.

Decision

To note the terms of the report.

4. SERVICE PERFORMANCE AND WLAM OUTCOME REPORT - FACILITIES MANAGEMENT

The Committee considered a report (copies of which had been circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive providing an overview of a service assessment from the West Lothian Assessment Model process (WLAM 2017/20).

The report also provided a summary of recommendations from the officer led panel that had been identified for action and were to be delivered by the service management team.

The report advised that self-assessment was an important part of the council's Best Value Framework, ensuring that there was rigorous challenge of performance and continuous improvement embedded at all levels of the organisation. Regular, programmed self-assessment was also an integral part of improvement planning and preparation for external inspections.

The report provided the outcome from the self-assessment of Facilities Management and the agreed recommendations for improvement for the service as well as a summary overview of performance.

The West Lothian Assessment Model applied an evidence based rigorous model – the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) Framework. This required employees to consider the long-term impact of the service in the stated objectives.

The Depute Chief Executive explained that Facilities Management provided catering, cleaning, crossing patrol guides and janitorial services throughout the authority. The service also included inprint, the council's in-house print management and reprographics service

The main activities of the service were to clean 169 buildings covering 309,806 square metres of floor space, it was anticipated that it would serve 2.6 million meals in 2019/20 and 84 crossing patrol points were maintained. The service also provided security, maintenance and janitorial service to 86 secondary, primary nursery and additional support schools digital reprographics, print finishing and direct mailing.

The service made a critical contribution to the council's corporate priority 1.

- Priority 1.6 – Continuing to provide access to a free Breakfast Club for all primary pupils and for secondary pupils with free meal entitlement, in recognition of the link between health and attainment.

The service went through the West Lothian Assessment Model process in 2018/19 with a representative group of employees from the service critically evaluating the service effectiveness in the nine criterion parts of the assessment model. The service scored 535.

Table 1 contained an overview of the service's score in the last four cycles. The trend column was based on a comparison between the base position and the current WLAM score.

The Review Panel in the WLAM Programme 2017/20 had three possible outcomes that would identify the progress and risk level of service performance and subsequently the level of scrutiny that would be applied to the service during the period of the WLAM programme. Table 2 provided the outcome of the Review Panel. Table 3 contained the evaluation of Performance Management in the service.

The Review Panel set out the following recommendations for the service:-

1. The Panel acknowledged the work that the service had undertaken to provide healthier options for school meals. This involved working with schools and marketing healthier options to parents and resulted in the achievement of the Food for Life Bronze Award.

2. The Panel encouraged the service to continue working to reduce the use of plastics and disposable plastics and note the good example of work done with West Calder High School to reduce plastic in school.

3. The Panel recognised the culture of change embedded in the service and how well the leadership team had managed change.

4. The service should review the scope of performance indicators in line with their key activities / priorities, ensuring all relevant measures were captured. This would include printing and reprographics activities.

5. The Panel recommended the service continue to review complaints process to ensure complaints were being captured across the service.

6. The Panel encouraged the service to look into ways to improve survey response rates, specifically with Head Teachers.

7. The Panel recommended the service identify ways to improve the levels of customer satisfaction (with customers outwith schools).

8. The Panel recommended the service continue to identify opportunities to benchmark performance.

An overview of the performance indicators categorised as Public or High Level were included in Appendix 2 to the report.

The service had no relevant performance/ranking information in the Local

Government Benchmarking Framework (LGBF) that related to the activities of Facilities Management services. It had proven difficult to benchmark with other local authorities due to the variance in operational models. However, the service did undertake benchmarking with other local authorities where possible.

In conclusion it was advised that Facilities Management completed the WLAM process as part of the council's corporate programme of self-assessment. This helped to ensure that excellent practice and performance was supported and that the principle of continuous improvement was adopted in all council services.

The report recommended that the Committee:-

1. Note the outcome from the WLAM and Review Panel process;

2. Note the recommendations for improvement;

3. Agree any other recommendations that may improve the performance of the service.

The Committee asked a series of questions in relation to the supply of food following exit from EU, cost of school meals, school crossing patrols, benchmarking and the use of plastics in schools.

It was explained that a working group had been established to ensure food supply in the event of any issues in relation to leaving the EU. It was also advised that the cost of school meals referred to was for food only.

In answer to a question on benchmarking in relation to cost of food and what was supplied by each local authority the officer advised that a total of 6 councils responded which ranked West Lothian as 3rd for the cost of food. As far as what food was supplied to schools, all authorities were bound by nutritional standards therefore provision was quite similar.

It had been reported that there was a difficulty in recruiting to school crossing patrol posts and following a suggestion that splitting the role may alleviate some of the difficulties the officer undertook to consider this as a way forward.

The officer explained that while good progress had been made in removing plastic bottles and other plastics from schools there was still a number of difficulties in rolling this out fully as there were still a number of barriers including the lack of water fountains and the cost of biodegradable alternatives.

Decision

To note the terms of the report.

5. SERVICE PERFORMANCE AND WLAM OUTCOME REPORT - PASSENGER TRANSPORT

The Committee considered a report (copies of which had been circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive providing an overview of a service assessment from the West Lothian Assessment Model process (WLAM 2017/20).

The report also provided a summary of recommendations from the officer led panel that had been identified for action and were to be delivered by the service management team.

The report advised that self-assessment was an important part of the council's Best Value Framework, ensuring that there was rigorous challenge of performance and continuous improvement embedded at all levels of the organisation. Regular, programmed self-assessment was also an integral part of improvement planning and preparation for external inspections.

The report provided the outcome from the self-assessment of Passenger Transport and the agreed recommendations for improvement for the service as well as a summary overview of performance.

The West Lothian Assessment Model applied an evidence based rigorous model – the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) Framework. This required employees to consider the long-term impact of the service in the stated objectives.

The Depute Chief Executive explained that Passenger Transport was responsible for ensuring the provision of efficient council public transport services within West Lothian and to neighbouring areas including infrastructure and publicity provision.

The service was also responsible for the provision of free and fare paying school transport services for schools, including pupils with additional support needs, as well as the provision of travel concessions for elderly and vulnerable residents. Appendix 1 to report contained a summary of the service activities.

The service made a critical contribution to the council's corporate priorities 8 as follows:

- Priority 8.4 – Maintaining roads network to support and sustain economic and population growth in the local area. Engaging with the community and commercial operators to deliver a cost effective public transport network and active travel options.

The service went through the West Lothian Assessment Model process in 2018/19 with a representative group of employees from the service critically evaluating the service effectiveness in the nine criterion parts of the assessment model. The service scored 479

Table 1 contained an overview of the service's score in the last four cycles. The trend column was based on a comparison between the base position and the current WLAM score.

The Review Panel in the WLAM Programme 2017/20 had three possible outcomes that would identify the progress and risk level of service performance and subsequently the level of scrutiny that would be applied to the service during the period of the WLAM programme. Table 2 provided the outcome of the Review Panel. Table 3 contained the evaluation of Performance Management in the service.

The Review Panel set out the following recommendations for the service:-

1. The Panel recognised that this was a new service that still had two distinct employee groups – Public Transport and Community Transport. The service should work to improve employee satisfaction by improving internal communication and employee engagement across all teams.

2. The service should segment and analyse the current and historical employee satisfaction indicators for both Public Transport and Community Transport, develop a better understanding of the base position and any improvement actions that should be developed for the new service.

3. The Panel noted the lack of Appraisal Development and Review (ADR) carried out for Community Transport employees and required the management to extend this process to all employees in the service as a priority action.

4. The Panel noted the level of sickness absence within the Community Transport and encouraged the service to utilise the council's policies and procedures to reduce absence.

5. The Panel encouraged the service to enhance the level and reach of customer engagement activity, with the aim of improving survey response rates and encouraging more feedback from service users, including complaint information.

6. The Panel noted the lack of segmentation of the service's customer groups and increase engagement activity with them to capture more qualitative information about the quality of services and their needs and preferences.

7. The service should identify opportunities to increase benchmarking activity and identify relevant comparators to help improve services and performance.

8. The service should improve the deployment of performance management approaches, including better trend chart commentaries for performance indicators fully explaining the fluctuations in trends.

9. The Panel encouraged the service to review the key outcomes / activities of Community Transport service and refine the suite of performance indicators.

An overview of the performance indicators categorised as Public or High Level were included in Appendix 2 to the report.

The function of Passenger Transport was structured differently in each local authority meaning that it was difficult to benchmark on a like for like basis. However, the services engaged in various benchmarking activities to monitor the performance of the service and identify best practice areas.

The report explained that the service took part in the National Highways and Transport Public Satisfaction Survey which collected public perspective on and satisfaction with Highway and Transport Services in local authority areas.

The service was also represented at the Association of Transport Co-ordinating Officers which helped to develop and promote good practice, and to formulate policies and standards and promote transport initiatives aimed at achieving better passenger transport services for all.

In conclusion it was advised that Passenger Transport completed the WLAM process as part of the council's corporate programme of self-assessment. This helped to ensure that excellent practice and performance was supported and that the principle of continuous improvement was adopted in all council services.

1. The report recommended that the Committee:-

2. Note the outcome from the WLAM and Review Panel process;

3. Note the recommendations for improvement;

Agree any other recommendations that may improve the performance of the service.

The Committee then asked a number of questions in relation to declining passenger usage, sustainability of current commercial routes, subsidised bus routes, and increased cost of school meal delivery.

In answer to the question in relation to subsidised bus routes the officer responded by advising that passenger numbers on subsidised services would be monitored and a review of routes being subsidised would be carried out to ascertain the current position.

With regard to the increase in cost of the delivery of school meals it was anticipated that figures for this year would show if this was an initial rise due to the additional meal provision for primary 1 to 3 and nurseries.

The officer acknowledged that passenger numbers were down however it was also noted that there was no benefit to the public from only having one supplier and therefore a commercial network strategy was introduced.

<u>Decision</u>

To note the terms of the report.

6. ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND REGENERATION REPORT - FOCUS REGENERATION

The Committee considered a report (copies of which had been circulated) by the Head of Planning, Economic Development and Regeneration providing an update on the work to support regeneration in West Lothian.

The report recalled that in September 2018 the Performance Committee agreed that an update on SIMD long term patterns; evidence of the impact that plans were having on the community and regeneration impacts were to be measured and reported back to a future meeting.

The Head of Planning, Economic Development and Regeneration explained that the Local Regeneration plans were progressing with most now live, and a number of activities being taken forward. Appendix 1 to the report set out the wider detail how regeneration would be measured and reported back. It detailed the range of strategies and plans that would help to deliver regeneration activities.

The work currently being done to develop Locality Regeneration Plans involved linking the plans to other key strategies including the Local Outcomes Improvement Plan, the Anti-Poverty Strategy, Economic Strategy, the work of the Health Localities, Development Planning and School attainment.

This information would then provide the Community Planning Partnership and the Performance Committee with a clear overview of regeneration across the Locality Regeneration Planning areas.

The report concluded that regeneration was integral to a number of the activities of West Lothian Council and the Community Planning Partnership.

The report recommended that the Performance Committee:

1. Provide feedback on the information provided; and

2. Consider whether the approach outlined would provide appropriate regeneration reporting.

The Committee was interested in how the team adjusted its approach to each of the 13 identified regeneration areas given the differing size and scale of each of them.

It was explained that all areas were at different levels and starting points. Some of the areas already had the structure in place while others required to be transported out of the area to access facilities. Steering groups were set up to ascertain client base and engage with as many groups as possible. However it was also noted that other opportunities for engagement could be considered.

It was also explained that Locality Plans addressed areas of deprivation,

following which mini plans were drawn up for the most deprived areas to allow resources to be utilised in the areas of most need.

It was the intention to build capacity by maximising external funding and strengthen community groups in an effort to provide an integrated knowledge system in order to reach clients from the most deprived data zones.

The Committee was interested in the relationship of the regeneration team and Anti-Poverty strategy. The Committee was advised that the regeneration team facilitated advice through Steering groups and worked with the Anti-Poverty Strategy at a drop in session in the Advice Shop, however no one attended the session.

The Committee felt that elected members did not receive enough feedback on Locality Regeneration Plans and expressed concern at there not being a role for elected member's involvement in the local regeneration process and community group meetings.

The officer undertook to provide an explanation to the Committee on the set up and structure of the council's Regeneration Framework.

It was suggested that a mechanism to address the lack of local elected member involvement in the local regeneration plan process be considered.

Decision

To note the terms of the report.

7. CITIZEN LED INSPECTION - UPDATE 2017 AND 2018

The Committee considered a report (copies of which had been circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive providing an overview of activity from the council's lay inspection programme.

The report advised that the council operated a programme of Citizen Led Inspections (CLI) which allowed lay inspectors to identify what worked well in council services and where services could be improved. The programme supported and enhanced the council's other quality and performance arrangements, with a specific focus on the council's Customer Service Strategy and how the overall standard of service received by customers could be improved.

The Depute Chief Executive explained that the council had made a commitment to carry out a scheduled programme of CLIs each year following a successful pilot phase in 2012/13.

This was deemed as a powerful improvement tool and involved customers in the design of services but one of the key challenges of the process was engagement from the local community and retaining inspectors beyond one or two inspections. In 2016/17 the process was reviewed and new

forms of inspection introduced in order to try to increase participation rates and representation from local people. Appendix 1 to the report provided an overview of the revised CLI offering.

CLIs were carried out by two to four inspectors usually with a mix of experience and knowledge. The composition of teams could still be improved by representation from different parts of the community. Although fair representation was achieved in terms of gender and different localities there was scope for improvement in other characteristics.

The report went on to advise that implementing the CLI process had required the council to maintain a register of citizen inspectors who were supported through access to training, guidance materials and a dedicated council resource.

Attempts to engage the community through a wide range of council media and contacts with various community groups had limited success. The time commitment required from participants may exclude significant parts of the community from the CLI process, particularly those in full-time employment and those with caring responsibilities.

It was further advised that at the end of the CLI process the service would be provided with a feedback report, the details of which would depend upon whether it was a full inspection or the simpler customer experience report of the “Look See” process.

Reports from both the full inspection and the “Look See” process would then be published on the council’s website and the outcome of the full inspection would also be reported to the relevant PDSP.

In conclusion it was advised that the Citizen Led Inspection was an important part of the council’s approach to improve service performance and engage with the community on the quality of the services provided.

The report recommended that the Committee note the terms of the report.

Decision

To note the terms of the report.

8. COMPLAINT PERFORMANCE REPORT QUARTER 3

The committee considered a report (copies of which had been circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive providing the council’s annual report 2018/19. Appendix 1 to the report contained the council wide performance against the SPSO defined measures covering the period Quarter 3 2018/19.

The committee was advised that the Scottish Public Services Ombudsman (SPSO) developed and published a model Complaint Handling Procedure (CHP) on 28 March 2012. The model CHP was to ensure a standardised approach in dealing with customer complaints across the local authority sector. All local authorities were required to

adopt the model CHP by 31 March 2013.

Table one provided a breakdown of complaints by complaint category over a 5 year period.

The Depute Chief Executive explained that the current service level complaint performance varied across the council and was linked to the complexity and quantity of complaints received. Housing, Customer and Building Services (HCBS) and Operational Services were the main complaint generators.

There was an increase in standard of service complaints and policy complaints which had been generated by Operational Services and Housing, Customer and Building Services. There was a decrease in waiting time complaints when compared to the equivalent quarter in the previous year. Employee Attitude complaints were driven by Operational Services and Housing, Customer and Building Services.

The Corporate Complaint Steering Board identified 4 high level indicators as follows:-

- Total complaints received
- Complaints closed within 5 working days
- Complaints closed within 20 working days
- Complaints partly upheld/upheld

Table 2 provided a summary of service performance against the 4 key indicators, while table 3 provided a service trend summary of closed complaints received by quarter 3.

Table 4 provided a service trend summary of upheld/part upheld complaints as a percentage of complaints received by quarter 3 covering 2017/18 and Q1 2018/19.

Table 5 provided indicative ratios for the number of complaints against the specific customer groups for Education Services, Housing, Customer and Building Services and Operational Services.

Across the council, 45.9% of all complaints received in quarter 3 2018/19 were upheld/part upheld. Operational Services received the highest number of complaints and also had one of the highest percentage of complaints that were upheld/part upheld.

In conclusion the report advised complaint numbers were at the lowest level when compared to the previous 4 quarters. This decrease was mainly related to Operational Services who continued to demonstrate a reduction in complaints closed on a quarterly basis.

It was recommended that the Performance Committee :-

1. Note the corporate and service complaint performance against the

standards outlined in the council's complaint handling procedure.

2. Continue to monitor complaint performance and request additional information from services as required.

Decision

1. To note the terms of the report.

9. PERFORMANCE COMMITTEE WORKPLAN

The Committee considered a list of items that would form the basis of the committee's work over the coming months.

Decision

To note the contents of the workplan.